

## **MINUTE VOLUME CONTENTS**

Cabinet (already approved by Council on 1 May 2019)	5 April 2019.....	809
Council	1 May 2019 .....	817
Cabinet	2 May 2019 .....	823
Appeals Committee	7 May 2019 .....	827
Education Committee	9 May 2019 .....	829
Licensing Committee	14 May 2019 .....	835
Planning Applications Committee	15 May 2019 .....	837
Local Review Body	15 May 2019 .....	841
Cabinet	6 June 2019 .....	843
Cabinet (Police & Fire)	6 June 2019 .....	845
Licensing Committee	11 June 2019 .....	849
Local Review Body	12 June 2019 .....	851
Education Committee	13 June 2019 .....	853
Audit & Scrutiny Committee	20 June 2019 .....	859



**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**CABINET**

**Minute of Meeting held at 10.00am in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock on 25 April 2019.**

**Present:**

Councillor Tony Buchanan (Leader)  
Councillor Caroline Bamforth  
Councillor Danny Devlin

Councillor Alan Lafferty  
Councillor Colm Merrick

Councillor Buchanan, Leader, in the Chair

**Attending:**

Caroline Innes, Deputy Chief Executive; Margaret McCrossan, Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer); Louise Pringle, Head of Business Change and Revenues; Jamie Reid, Strategic Insight and Communities Senior Manager; Alison Findlay, Policy and Employment Law Adviser; and Paul O'Neil, Committee Services Officer.

**Apology:**

Councillor Paul O'Kane (Deputy Leader).

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**860.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**JOINT CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE (FIRST TIER)**

**861.** The Cabinet considered and noted the Minute of the meeting of the Joint Consultative Committee (First Tier) held on 14 February 2019, which forms Appendix 1 accompanying this Minute.

**BEST VALUE ASSURANCE REPORT – ACTION PLAN UPDATE**

**862.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of the Cabinet of 26 April 2018 (Page 369, Item 395 refers), when it was agreed amongst other things to approve the Best Value Assurance Report (BVAR) action plan update, the Cabinet considered a report by the Chief Executive, providing an update on the delivery of the action plan arising from the Council's Best Value Assurance Report (BVAR) that had been published in November 2017, following an audit of Best Value carried out by Audit Scotland on behalf of the Accounts Commission. A copy of the action plan update as at April 2019 was appended to the report.

The report explained that in terms of the Local Government in Scotland Act 2003, councils had a statutory duty to secure Best Value and that the Council had been subject to its second audit of Best Value in 2017 which had covered a range of issues. Arising from that audit, 5 recommendations were made in the areas of member scrutiny; strategic planning; spending against revenue budgets; community engagement and empowerment; and option appraisal.

Whilst noting that evidence had been listed against each of the recommendations as detailed in the appendix to the report, the report indicated that this demonstrated how the Council had completed the actions specified in the action plan. The evidence included supporting elected member scrutiny via training and the recruitment of an additional temporary officer to further enhance the work of the Audit and Scrutiny Committee; clarifying the Council's longer term approach to financial planning and demonstrating the integration of the Council's strategic plans.

Furthermore, specific actions against longer term areas such as reviewing service planning, implementing budgeting, progress on City Deal projects and demonstrating the use of option appraisals had also been progressed and would be taken forward as part of day to day business.

The report concluded by highlighting that the Council had shown its ongoing commitment to achieving Best Value for East Renfrewshire's residents and communities and that a robust monitoring process was in place. The action plan demonstrated the Council's progress and strong culture of continuous improvement and modernisation. It was noted that there would be ongoing annual scrutiny of the Council's arrangements for Best Value as part of the yearly external audit process.

The Cabinet:

- (a) approved the Best Value action plan update as at April 2019; and
- (b) otherwise noted the completion of the actions in the action plan.

### **UPDATE ON MODERN, AMBITIOUS PROGRAMME (MAP)**

**863.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of the Cabinet of 21 June 2018 (Page 445, Item 472 refers), when the Cabinet agreed amongst other things to note that work was underway to develop and enhance the Council's approach to reporting on the modern, ambitious programme, the Cabinet considered a report by the Deputy Chief Executive, providing a high level update on the Modern, Ambitious Programme (MAP) including Core Systems and delivery of the Digital Strategy.

The report explained that the Council's Modern, Ambitious Programme (MAP) sought to modernise the way in which the Council worked; addressed the pressures of increasing demands and financial constraints; and concentrated on three of the Council's five capabilities which were noted as modernising, digital and data. Given the financial situation of the Council, MAP projects had tended to focus on financial savings whilst still protecting or improving outcomes for the Council's citizens.

Details of the six major programmes of change were outlined in the report and were noted as Core Systems; Digital; Environmental change programme; HSCP change programme (Fit for the Future); Education change programme; and Corporate and Community Services change programme. Whilst noting the progress that had been made to develop strategic programme reporting for the Council's change programmes, the report provided an update on the Core

Systems programme and indicated that the Council had awarded a 5-year contract for a new Finance/Procurement system with scope for five 12 month extensions should this be required and the award of a 4-year contract for a new HR/Payroll system.

In terms of the Council's Digital Strategy which had been approved at the meeting of the Cabinet on 21 June 2018, the report advised that the Council had now established a Digital Board; and provided a detailed overview of all the digital projects ongoing across the Council together with a scored evaluation of how digital the Council's processes were. Furthermore, the Local Government Digital Office had carried out a Digital Maturity assessment earlier this year which had resulted in a positive outcome. Details of the key departmental change projects being carried out in the Council were also outlined in the report together with confirmation that the 2019/20 savings targets were on track to be delivered.

The Cabinet:

- (a) noted the progress to develop strategic programme reporting for the Council's change programmes;
- (b) noted the award of a 5-year contract for a new Finance/Procurement system, with scope with five 12-month extensions if required;
- (c) noted the award of a 4-year contract for a new HR/Payroll system;
- (d) commented the significant progress to develop a Digital Board and digital programme, including analysis of digital skills and scoring of digital processes;
- (e) acknowledged the positive outcomes of the Local Government Digital Offices Digital Maturity Assessment of the Council;
- (f) noted the overview of the key departmental change projects; and
- (g) noted the departmental confirmation that 2019/20 savings targets were on track to be delivered.

#### **PROGRESS ON THE COUNCIL'S EQUALITY AND HUMAN RIGHTS MAINSTREAMING AND OUTCOMES PROGRAMME: 2017-21**

**864.** The Cabinet considered a report by the Deputy Chief Executive, providing an update on the Council's programme to fulfil its equality and human rights duties in accordance with the report published in April 2017 entitled "Review of the Council's Equality and Human Rights Requirements and Plans for Equality Outcomes 2017-2021". A copy of the document was appended to the report.

The report outlined the Council's equality duties as required by the provisions of the Equality Act 2010 and the Equality Act 2010 (Specific Duties)(Scotland) Regulations 2012 and explained that every two years the Council was required by law to publish a report on the progress made to achieve the equality outcomes it had set, no later than 30 April. In addition, the Council was required to publish a report on progress towards making the general equality duty integral to the exercise of its functions, so as to better perform that duty. The information that should be included in these follow-up reports was also outlined in the report.

Whilst noting the engagement and consultation that had taken place which had employed a number of methods used to track progress in fulfilling the Council's equality commitments. Feedback from discussion workshops from the 'Bridges to Change' conference was also outlined in the report.

812

The Cabinet:-

- (a) noted the terms of the report; and
- (b) approved the report for publication on the Council's website by 30 April 2019.

CHAIR

**MINUTE**

of

**JOINT CONSULTATIVE COMMITTEE (FIRST TIER)**

**Minute of Meeting held at 2.00pm in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock on 14 February 2019.**

**Present:**

Councillor Caroline Bamforth

Councillor Tony Buchanan

**Union Representatives:**

Ms Karen Catlow (UNISON)

Mr Gordon Lees (UNISON)

Ms Sharon Kelly (EIS)

Mr Des Morris (EIS)

Mr Mark Kirkland (UNISON)

Mr James O'Connell (UNITE)

Mr Steven Larkin (UNISON)

Councillor Tony Buchanan in the Chair

**Attending:**

Lorraine McMillan, Chief Executive; Caroline Innes, Deputy Chief Executive; Margaret McCrossan, Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer); Sharon Dick, Head of HR and Corporate Services; Tracy Morton, Education Senior Manager; and Linda Hutchison, Senior Committee Services Officer.

**Apologies:**

Councillors Paul O'Kane and Stewart Miller; and Mr Joe Lynch (UNISON).

**MINUTE OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

1. The committee considered and approved as a correct record the Minute of the meeting held on 15 February 2018.

**REVENUE BUDGET 2019/20**

2. Councillor Buchanan confirmed that the Scottish Government had recently approved the final 2019/20 grant allocation for local authorities, quantifying the level of additional grant allocated to the Council recently over and above the provisional grant announced in December 2018.

The Head of Accountancy reported that the last time discussions with the Trade Unions had taken place, a budgetary shortfall of approximately £14m had been indicated, this having been reduced to approximately £4m, taking account of the 2019/20 savings approved by the Council in March 2018 as part of the indicative future budgets set at that time covering 3

financial years. Having commented on the grant allocation mechanism used by the Scottish Government, she reported that the recent announcement of an additional £1.78m was welcome and helpful.

Whilst referring to various changes and elements of flexibility that had been announced by the Scottish Government, the Head of Accountancy clarified that local authorities were required to limit any Council Tax increase for 2019/20 to a maximum on 4.79% which equated to 3% in real terms. It was explained that, through the settlement, local authorities had also been given discretionary powers to introduce a new tourist tax and a workplace parking levy, both of which would require to be considered further if the Council opted to consider doing so. Whilst referring to flexibility promised regarding Non-Domestic Rates (NDR) in advance of the next property revaluation in 2022, the Head of Accountancy clarified that the settlement offered Councils discretion to vary the level of NDR empty property relief in the future. It also offered local authorities discretion to vary loans fund repayment arrangements for advances made before April 2016. She clarified that detailed guidance and legislation to enable these options to be considered in future remained outstanding, adding that the provision on loan repayments could be helpful in future years but not necessarily in 2019/20.

The Head of Accountancy confirmed that the Scottish Government had also given a further commitment to move to 3 year settlements from 2020/21 which would greatly assist the Council with future financial planning, and also to publish legislation during the term of the current Parliament on options to replace the Council Tax system of funding local government. Further developments and guidance on both issues were awaited.

Whilst referring to the remaining budgetary shortfall of £1.9m for 2019/20 which remained to be identified over and above savings already agreed, the Head of Accountancy commented on the restriction on the level of savings that could be applied to Integration Joint Board (IJB) budgets and related issues. She also explained that the increase in contributions to the teacher superannuation scheme had not been quite as severe as anticipated originally.

In response to Mr Lees, the Head of Accountancy confirmed that the provision to vary loans fund repayment arrangements would apply to historic loans entered into prior to April 2016 rather than future ones. She further clarified that it did not apply to PPP/PFI schemes. Councillor Buchanan referred to the need to await the exact terms of related guidance and legislation to confirm the extent to which related savings could be achieved.

Having welcomed the forthcoming introduction of multi-year budget settlements, Mr O'Connell expressed the view that the workplace parking levy, if introduced locally, would only impact on the Corporate Management Team and Elected Members for whom dedicated parking places were provided. Councillor Buchanan clarified that the Council's position on such provision still required to be determined formally, but that a lot of additional work would be required to introduce this and that the Council had no intention of imposing additional costs on employees. He welcomed devolved powers being given to local authorities, but clarified that they would not all necessarily be utilised in East Renfrewshire at present.

Mr Morris welcomed the opportunity that had been given to the Trade Unions to make representations on the budget, referring to the extent of the concerns that existed on budget savings including those associated with Pupil Support Assistants. Mr Lees also referred to concerns regarding the future of bilingual services and technical services commenting on the extent to which they were used and would be missed if related savings were made. In reply, Councillor Buchanan referred to the need to look at all costs to identify savings, clarified that representations made by the Trade Unions were considered, and commented on the efforts being made to limit the impact of savings on services and to do so as well and as fairly as possible. Having heard Mr Lees welcome the opportunity to contribute to the redesign of

services to contribute to the identification of savings, Councillor Buchanan referred to related benefits of such reviews and the importance of involving those delivering services in them.

In response to Mr Lees, Councillor Buchanan confirmed that some discussion had taken place on the discretionary power being given to local authorities to vary the level of Council Tax empty property relief in future, adding that consideration was always given to what benefits could be accrued from the use of discretionary powers. The Head of Accountancy confirmed that costings associated with such proposals would be considered.

It was agreed to note the position and comments made.

### **HEALTH AND SAFETY COMMITTEE**

3. The committee considered the Minutes of the meetings of the Council's Health and Safety Committee held on 24 January, 25 April, 29 August and 12 December 2018.

Mr Morris referred to discussions on communications on the reporting of accidents and incidents at the meeting on 12 December and subsequently, welcoming that a further staff newsletter was to be issued and other action being taken to promote awareness of health and safety issues and procedures. Councillor Buchanan welcomed this also.

The committee noted the Minutes and comments made.

### **DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

4. The committee noted that confirmation of the date of the next meeting, which was scheduled to take place on Thursday, 9 May 2019, would be circulated.



**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**EAST RENFREWSHIRE COUNCIL**

**Minute of Meeting held at 7.00pm in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock, on 1 May 2019.**

**Present:**

Provost Jim Fletcher	Councillor Annette Ireland
Councillor Paul Aitken	Councillor Alan Lafferty
Councillor Caroline Bamforth	Councillor David Macdonald
Councillor Tony Buchanan (Leader)	Councillor Jim McLean
Councillor Angela Convery	Councillor Colm Merrick
Councillor Danny Devlin	Councillor Stewart Miller
Councillor Charlie Gilbert	Councillor Paul O’Kane
Councillor Barbara Grant	Councillor Gordon Wallace

Provost Fletcher in the Chair

**Attending:**

Lorraine McMillan, Chief Executive; Caroline Innes, Deputy Chief Executive; Mhairi Shaw, Director of Education; Andy Cahill, Director of Environment; Margaret McCrossan, Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer); Fiona Morrison, Head of Education Services (Provision and Resources); Barbara Clark, Chief Accountant; Graeme Smith, Communications Manager; Eamonn Daly, Democratic Services Manager; and Jennifer Graham, Committee Services Officer.

**Apologies:**

Depute Provost Betty Cunningham, and Councillor Jim Swift.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**865.** Councillors Grant, Merrick and O’Kane declared a non-financial interest in relation to Item 872 by virtue of the fact that they were members of the East Renfrewshire Culture and Leisure Trust Board.

**MINUTE OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

**866.** The Council, having heard Councillor Bamforth, considered and approved the Minute of the meeting held on 28 February 2019 subject to the first paragraph on page 750 (Item 804) being amended to reflect that Audit Scotland had commented that East Renfrewshire Council’s current level of borrowing was one of the lowest in Scotland.

## **MINUTES OF MEETINGS OF COMMITTEES**

**867.** The Council considered and approved the Minutes of the meetings of the undernoted, except as otherwise referred to in Item 868 below:-

- (a) Planning Applications Committee – 13 March 2019;
- (b) Local Review Body – 13 March 2019;
- (c) Cabinet – 14 March 2019;
- (d) Audit and Scrutiny Committee – 14 March 2019;
- (e) Licensing Committee – 19 March 2019;
- (f) Appeals Committee – 21 March 2019;
- (g) Education Committee – 28 March 2019;
- (h) Cabinet – 4 April 2019;
- (i) Planning Applications Committee – 10 April 2019;
- (j) Licensing Committee – 16 April 2019;
- (k) Cabinet – 25 April 2019.

## **CABINET – 14 MARCH 2019 – REQUEST TO RECORD PROCEEDINGS**

**868.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of the Cabinet of 14 March 2019 (Page 771, Item 818 refers), Councillor Macdonald, referring to a request to record proceedings which had been refused, sought clarification regarding the reason why the request to audio record had been refused; why the reason had not been recorded in the Minute of the meeting; and why there was a disparity in dealing with these requests at different meetings.

In reply, Provost Fletcher commented that it was up to committees to consider each request on its own merits. Referring to the meeting in question, Councillor Buchanan advised that all members in attendance had agreed that the meeting should not be audio recorded as the Minute provided a record of the discussions which took place.

The Council noted the comments made.

## **GENERAL FUND CAPITAL PROGRAMME 2018/19**

**869.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of the Cabinet of 14 March 2019 (Page 773, Item 822 refers), when it was agreed to recommend to the Council that the proposed adjustments to the General Fund Capital Programme 2018/19 be approved, the Council considered a report by the Chief Financial Officer, recommending adjustments to the 2018/19 General Fund Capital Programme in light of issues that had arisen since the programme had been approved.

The Council:-

- (a) approved the movements within the General Fund Capital Programme 2018/19; and
- (b) noted that the shortfall of £318,000 would be managed and reported within the final accounts for the year.

## **HOUSING CAPITAL PROGRAMME 2018/19**

**870.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of the Cabinet of 14 March 2019 (Page 773, Item 823 refers), when it was agreed to recommend to the Council that the proposed

adjustments to the Housing Capital Programme 2018/19 be approved, the Council considered a joint report by the Chief Financial Officer and Director of Environment, recommending adjustments to the 2018/19 Housing Capital Programme in light of issues that had arisen since the programme had been approved.

The Council:-

- (a) approved the movements within the Housing Capital Programme 2018/19; and
- (b) noted that the shortfall of £85,000 would be managed and reported within the final accounts for the year.

## **STATEMENTS BY CONVENERS/REPRESENTATIVES ON JOINT BOARDS/COMMITTEES**

**871.** The following statements were made:-

(a) **Integration Joint Board – Councillor Bamforth**

Councillor Bamforth reported that at the Integration Joint Board (IJB) meetings on 20 March and 1 May, the Board had received an update from the Chief Financial Officer on the national budget settlement and agreed the Integration Joint Board budget for 2019/20.

Councillor Bamforth also explained that the IJB had received updates on the Family Wellbeing Service; Care at Home Service; and Corporate Parenting Plan. The IJB also agreed that the partnership would host the Augmentative and Alternative Communication Services which provided equipment and support to those individuals who had little or no clear speech, and also agreed the response to the Ministerial Strategic Group for Health and Community Care self-evaluation. She advised that Anne-Marie Monaghan had recently been appointed as the new Chair of the IJB, taking over from Morag Brown whose contribution to the IJB was recognised. The IJB also expressed their thanks to Dr Craig Masson who had stepped down as Clinical Director.

It was confirmed that the next IJB meeting was scheduled to take place on 26 June 2019.

The Council noted the position.

(b) **Community Services and Community Safety – Councillor Merrick**

Councillor Merrick reported that the Culture and Leisure Trust had invested in new technology at Eastwood Theatre which had led to the launch of the National Theatre Live programme. A sell out audience had enjoyed a live broadcast of All about Eve and a further programme of performances was scheduled.

Councillor Merrick also reported on his attendance at the third East Renfrewshire Culture and Leisure Staff Recognition Awards at Eastwood House. The awards had recognised Team Work, Professionalism, the Pursuit of Excellence, Customer Service and Commitment to the Community. Further awards were given for Team of the Year, Young Employee of the Year and the Chair's Award for Outstanding Contribution.

Councillor Merrick then referred to the Active Schools programme which had been running since 2004 and was designed to provide more and higher quality opportunities for children and young people to take part in physical activity before and after lessons and during lunchtimes. He advised that the programme was delivered on behalf of East Renfrewshire Council by the Leisure Trust and the latest data from **sportscotland** showed that Active Schools sessions in East Renfrewshire were at their highest ever levels. **Sportscotland** had recently confirmed that East Renfrewshire would be one of the few authorities in Scotland to receive funding for a further four years.

The Council noted the position.

### **EAST RENFREWSHIRE CULTURE AND LEISURE TRUST BOARD APPOINTMENTS**

**872.** The Council considered a report by the Director of Education seeking the nomination of a new independent board member for the Trust following a recent resignation, and seeking the appointment of a replacement Elected Member on the Trust Board following the resignation of Councillor Devlin.

The report explained that as there were no suitable candidates on the register for independent positions at the time of the vacancy an open recruitment exercise had been conducted to identify a suitable candidate for the vacant position, and potential future candidates for any subsequent vacancies which may arise in future. A consultant was retained to run the recruitment campaign and, following an interview by a committee consisting of five board members, Mr Rob Crusher was chosen as the preferred candidate. Mr Crusher's relevant skills and experience were outlined.

It was further reported that Councillor Devlin had recently tendered his resignation from the Trust Board and the Council was asked to consider the appointment of a replacement Elected Member. Councillor Merrick, seconded by Councillor O'Kane, proposed that Provost Fletcher be appointed to the Trust Board. There were no other nominations.

The Council agreed:-

- (a) to approve the recommendation of East Renfrewshire Culture and Leisure Trust Board's nominated candidate, Mr Rob Crusher, in accordance with the Trust Articles of Association; and
- (b) that Provost Fletcher be appointed as Council Devlin's replacement on the Trust Board.

### **PROVOST'S ENGAGEMENTS**

**873.** The Council considered a report by the Deputy Chief Executive, providing details of civic engagements attended and civic duties performed by Provost Fletcher since the previous meeting.

Further to the report Provost Fletcher reported that he had recently met with two individuals from the town of Barrhead, Alberta, Canada who were touring Scotland and who had been asked by the Mayor of that town to present a letter and small gifts to the Provost of East Renfrewshire. The Provost gave the individuals a letter containing good wishes from East Renfrewshire to pass on to the Mayor on their return to Barrhead.

Provost Fletcher read out the letter from the Mayor and advised Elected Members that a copy of the local newspaper, postcards and badges from the town were available to view in Members' Services.

The Council noted the report and comments made.

## **VISION FOR THE FUTURE**

**874.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of 31 October 2018 (Page 592, Item 661 refers), when it was agreed that a revised Vision for the Future document would be brought back to the Council for approval, the Council considered a report by the Chief Executive seeking consideration of a draft revision of "Vision for the Future", setting out the long-term ambitions for the work of East Renfrewshire Council based on a horizon of 10 years.

The report explained that significant work had been undertaken to improve the integration of strategic and operational planning and the refreshed "Vision for the Future" document would sit under the Community Plan and above the Outcome Delivery Plan, setting out the Council's long-term strategy and plans to deliver its part of the Community Plan. The "Vision for the Future" document was considered to be an early draft which would allow further conversations on the broader strategic context and ambitions for East Renfrewshire to take place over the summer and into the autumn. Initial work would consider "Vision for the Future" in the context of equality impact and Fairer Scotland assessments.

In response to questions, the Director of Environment advised that developers would be encouraged to include sufficient electric car charging facilities within any new-build developments as part of the policies contained within LDP2. He further advised that no decisions had been made about any future developments at Shawwood and an options report and associated master planning report on the future of Eastwood Park would be submitted to the Council in due course, although no firm date for submission could be provided at the present time. He added that development of Eastwood Park may include consideration of a themed campus with a further education element, but this was a visionary aspiration and no firm conclusions had yet been reached. The Chief Executive clarified that the word campus had been used to describe Eastwood Park as a whole and did not necessarily relate solely to educational facilities.

Having heard a number of Members commend the report, the Chief Executive confirmed that comments on the early draft of the document would be sought over the next few months; work would continue on LDP2, education provision, the master planning of Eastwood Park, and the provision of leisure facilities; and briefings for Elected Members would be provided.

The Council agreed:-

- (a) to note the updated outcomes, capabilities and values which made up the overarching strategy;
- (b) to further development of "Vision for the Future" taking into account the ongoing work on the Local Development Plan, the refreshed Capital Investment Strategy and City Region economic planning; and
- (c) otherwise, to note the comments made.

**EUROPEAN PARLIAMENTARY ELECTIONS – CHANGES TO POLLING PLACES**

**875.** The Council considered a report by the Chief Executive advising of changes to two polling places at the forthcoming European parliamentary elections due to unavailability of the approved polling places.

The report explained that a review of the current polling scheme was underway and, due to the uncertainty at the time around participation in the European parliamentary elections, the election team had carried out a review of existing polling places to ascertain their availability. During the review it was established that Crookfur Pavilion and Mearns Parish Church Hall would be unavailable and potential alternatives within the area were identified as Broom Parish Church and the Lygates Building. Under previously approved delegated powers, the Chief Executive had approved the decision to use Broom Parish Church and the Lygates Building for the forthcoming European parliamentary elections.

The Council noted:-

- (a) the use of Broom Parish Church and the Lygates Building as replacements for Crookfur Pavilion and Mearns Parish Church Hall respectively at the forthcoming European parliamentary elections; and
- (b) that the changes had been made by the Chief Executive under the delegated powers granted by the Council in February 2014.

**CALENDAR OF MEETINGS 2020**

**876.** The Council considered a report by the Deputy Chief Executive, seeking approval for the 2020 meetings calendar.

Whilst noting that in terms of the Council's Standing Orders, it was necessary for the full Council to approve the calendar subject to the ability of committees to revise dates thereafter, the report highlighted that in recent years, due to the late approval of the Scottish Government Budget and the subsequent late confirmation of Local Government funding levels, it had been necessary for the originally scheduled Budget Meeting to be cancelled and re-arranged at relatively short notice.

The report proposed that given the problems experienced in the past, the scheduled Budget Meeting had been amended in 2019 to the end of February at which time it was expected that funding levels would have been confirmed before then and so the need for cancelling and re-arranging the meeting would be eliminated or at the very least minimised. As this arrangement had worked satisfactorily in 2019, it was proposed to continue this arrangement in 2020. It was further reported that appropriate dates had been built into the calendar in relation to the timing of the presentation of the Treasury Management Strategy; the draft Annual Accounts; and the final Annual Accounts.

The Council approved the 2020 meetings calendar.

**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**CABINET**

**Minute of Meeting held at 10.00am in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock on 2 May 2019.**

**Present:**

Councillor Tony Buchanan (Leader)  
Councillor Caroline Bamforth  
Councillor Alan Lafferty

Councillor Colm Merrick  
Councillor Paul O'Kane

Councillor Buchanan, Leader, in the Chair

**Attending:**

Lorraine McMillan, Chief Executive; Andy Cahill, Director of Environment; Margaret McCrossan, Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer); Louise Pringle, Head of Communities, Revenues and Change; Phil Daws, Head of Environment (Strategic Services); Kim Gear, Corporate Policy Officer; and Paul O'Neil, Committee Services Officer.

**Apology:**

Councillor Danny Devlin.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**877.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**DRAFT OUTCOME DELIVERY PLAN 2019/22**

**878.** The Cabinet considered a report by the Chief Executive, providing details of the Council's draft Outcome Delivery Plan (ODP) 2019/22 which set out the Council's contribution to the delivery of its strategic outcomes for East Renfrewshire. A copy of the plan was appended to the report.

The report highlighted that the purpose of the ODP was to communicate the Council's priorities on how it was going to deliver on its strategic outcomes in the Community Plan and the Council's vision 'to be a modern ambitious Council creating a fairer future with all'. Furthermore, it was a rolling 3-year plan that was updated annually and set out the key critical activities Council services were planning to carry out to achieve better outcomes for the Council's customers and residents, with the ultimate aim of making people's lives better.

However, as the new Community Plan had only been approved in June 2018, a light touch approach had been taken to reviewing the ODP this year and as a result the outcomes and intermediate outcomes had remained the same. Council departments, East Renfrewshire

Culture and Leisure Trust, and the Health and Social Care Partnership (HSCP) had worked on reviewing and updating the ODP mapping diagrams and setting targets to 2022 where possible.

The report indicated that work to link some contributions and critical activities to the HSCP Strategic Implementation Plan was ongoing to ensure alignment across the plans. Details of the four main sections of the plan were outlined in the report these being noted as Strategic Outcomes 1-5; Customer, Efficiency and People outcomes; Finance Information – Spending Plans; and Annexes.

It was noted that as the ODP was a strategic, Council-wide plan, it could not cover the extensive range of planned activity to be undertaken across the Council over the lifetime of the plan. However, the plan acknowledged the service strategies and operational plans that underpinned strategic outcome delivery.

The report also provided information in relation to target setting and performance monitoring, and the use of the ODP to test the new Fairer Scotland duty that required public bodies to actively consider how they could reduce inequalities of outcome caused by socioeconomic disadvantage in any major strategic decisions.

The Cabinet:-

- (a) approved the content of the draft Outcome Delivery Plan 2019/22;
- (b) agreed to **recommend to the Council** that the draft Outcome Delivery Plan 2019/22 be approved; and
- (c) noted the outcome of the Fairer assessment pilot.

## GLASGOW CITY REGION CITY DEAL UPDATE

**879.** The Cabinet considered a report by the Director of Environment, providing details of the progress made to date in relation to the Council's participation in the Glasgow City Region City Deal programme.

Whilst noting that the £1.13 billion City Deal infrastructure fund across the Glasgow City region was aimed at enabling a programme of works that would greatly add to the value of the local regional economy over the next 20 years, the report highlighted that East Renfrewshire would benefit from a £44 million investment package comprising £38 million investment from the Scottish and UK Governments and co-funded by the Council through a £6 million capital funding contribution.

The report highlighted that a number of ambitious projects had been developed which would stimulate economic growth in East Renfrewshire, improve transport links, increase leisure opportunities, support business development and unlock residential land. Updates on each of the Council's projects were outlined in the report, these being noted as the Lavern Works Regeneration; Greenlaw Business Centre; Balgraystone Road Improvement; Aurs Road Improvement; Country Park Visitor Facilities; New Rail Station at Barrhead South; and Newton Mearns to Barrhead new road connection.

The report also explained that to comply with new HM Treasury Green Book governance arrangements as required by the UK and Scottish Governments updated business cases had been submitted to the City Deal Programme Management Office.

The Cabinet noted:-

- (a) the contents of the report and the progress made on the development and implementation of East Renfrewshire's £44 million City Deal programme; and
- (b) that updated outline business cases for the East Renfrewshire City Deal programme had been submitted to the City Deal Programme Management Office to comply with new HM Treasury Green Book governance arrangements as required by the UK and Scottish Governments.

### **RAPID REHOUSING TRANSITION PLAN 2019/24**

**880.** The Cabinet considered a report by the Director of Environment, seeking approval for the proposed Rapid Rehousing Transition Plan (RRTP) 2019/24. A copy of the draft RRTP which had been submitted to the Scottish Government in December 2018 was appended to the report.

The report indicated that the Scottish Government had set up the Homelessness and Rough Sleepers Action Group (HARSAG) in October 2017 to produce short and long-term solutions to end homelessness and rough sleeping. A key recommendation made by the group was that all local authorities transition to a rapid rehousing approach. It was noted that "rapid rehousing" was about taking a housing-led approach for rehousing people that had experienced homelessness, making sure they reached a settled housing option as quickly as possible rather than staying in temporary accommodation for too long.

The report explained that RRTP established how the Council, in conjunction with partners, would transition towards taking a rapid rehousing approach to its homelessness services. Furthermore, it set out an action plan for the next 5-years with four key priorities. These were noted as increasing emphasis on prevention work; reviewing current temporary accommodation to ensure processes and stock remained appropriate; reviewing housing support; and exploring options for making use of the Housing First model of supported accommodation within East Renfrewshire.

The Cabinet approved the:-

- (a) Rapid Rehousing Transition Plan (RRTP) 2019/24; and
- (b) submission of the plan to the Scottish Government.

CHAIR



**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**APPEALS COMMITTEE**

**Minute of Meeting held at 2.00pm in the Committee Room, Council Headquarters, Giffnock on 7 May 2019.**

**Present:**

Councillor Barbara Grant  
Councillor Annette Ireland

Councillor Stewart Miller

Councillor Grant in the Chair

**Attending:**

Alison Findlay, Policy and Employment Law Adviser; Siobhan Wilson, Solicitor; and Paul O'Neil, Committee Services Officer.

**Apologies:**

Councillors Angela Convery (Chair) and Betty Cunningham (Vice Chair).

**APPOINTMENT OF CHAIR**

In the absence of the Chair and Vice Chair, the committee agreed that Councillor Grant chair the meeting.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**881.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**Resolution to Exclude Press and Public**

At this point in the meeting, on the motion of the Chair, the committee unanimously resolved that in accordance with the provisions of Section 50A(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, as amended, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the following item of business on the grounds that it involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Paragraph 1 of Part I of Schedule 7A to the Act.

**DISMISSAL APPEAL – HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE PARTNERSHIP**

**882.** The appellant appeared, accompanied by a friend, in connection with her appeal. Candy Millard, Head of Strategic Services and Margaret MacKenzie, Senior HR Officer appeared on behalf of management.

Both parties made their submissions to the committee and were heard in answer to questions on their submissions, during which Ms Gayle Smart, Localities Intensive Services Manager, entered the meeting as a witness for management and was heard in response to questions from both parties and Elected Members.

Following consideration, both parties were recalled and advised by the Chair that the committee had agreed that the grounds of the appeal had not been substantiated and that the appeal was not upheld.

CHAIR

**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**EDUCATION COMMITTEE**

**Minute of Meeting held at 10.00am in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock on 9 May 2019.**

**Present:**

Councillor Paul O’Kane (Chair)	Councillor Alan Lafferty
Councillor Colm Merrick (Vice Chair)	Councillor Gordon Wallace
Councillor Caroline Bamforth	Dr Frank Angell
Councillor Tony Buchanan	Mr Des Morris
Councillor Charlie Gilbert	

Councillor O’Kane in the Chair

**Attending:**

Janice Collins, Head of Education Services (Equality and Equity); Fiona Morrison, Head of Education Services (Provision and Resources); Mark Ratter, Head of Education Services (Quality Improvement and Performance); Tracy Morton, Education Senior Manager; and Jennifer Graham, Committee Services Officer.

**Also Attending:**

Catherine Dillon-Ruddy, Head Teacher, Our Lady of the Missions Primary School.

**Apologies:**

Ms Dorothy Graham and Ms Mary McIntyre.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**883.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**EDUCATION SCOTLAND REPORT ON OUR LADY OF THE MISSIONS PRIMARY SCHOOL**

**884.** The committee considered a report by the Director of Education informing members of the outstanding report by Education Scotland following their inspection of Our Lady of the Missions Primary School. A copy of the inspection report accompanied the report.

The Head of Education Services (Quality Improvement and Performance) explained that in assessing the two quality indicators, Education Scotland had judged one indicator to be excellent and one to be very good. Key strengths were highlighted, including highly

articulate, confident and ambitious children; close cluster working and careful tracking of children's progress; highly effective leadership; very high levels of attainment in literacy, numeracy and science; and a focus on high quality learning and teaching.

He went on to explain that this was an outstanding report with the judgements made by Education Scotland being very close to the department's evaluation of the quality of provision. The department was particularly pleased that the leadership of the Head Teacher and senior management team had been noted in the letter to parents/carers as one of the key strengths.

The inspection team had agreed two areas for improvement with the school and the department. However, given that the school had been judged to be excellent in one of the indicators assessed and very good in the other, there was no need for an additional action plan to address the areas for improvement. The school would continue to use the results of its own self-evaluation to identify priorities for improvement which would be published in its annual standards and quality report and school plan.

Education Scotland would make no further reports in connection with the inspection of Our Lady of the Missions Primary School and the department recommended that the school be accredited for its achievements. This would mean that the authority would not carry out any formal quality assurance activities in Our Lady of the Missions Primary School for a period of 3 years from the date of publication of the report.

Commenting on a concern raised regarding questionnaire feedback from parents and pupils, the Head of Education Services (Quality Improvement and Performance) reassured members that the content of questionnaires was discussed in full during the inspection process and would be dealt with as appropriate.

Ms Dillon-Ruddy, Head Teacher, explained that she was extremely proud of the report, which had been achieved through the hard work and commitment of everyone involved with the school. She praised strong cluster working and thanked the Education Department Directorate for their continued support.

Having heard Councillor O'Kane, on behalf of the committee, commend all those involved in achieving an excellent report, the committee agreed:-

- (a) to note the content of the Education Scotland report on Our Lady of the Missions Primary School; and
- (b) to commend the school's achievements by awarding it accreditation from May 2019 until May 2022.

## **S1 INTAKE AT ST. NINIAN'S HIGH SCHOOL SESSION 2019-20**

**885.** The committee considered a report by the Director of Education advising of arrangements deemed to be necessary to accommodate the secondary 1 (S1) intake at St. Ninian's High School for school session 2019-20.

The report explained that the current policy restricted the S1 intake to 300 places and additional teaching accommodation would be available from session 2021-22. However, applications from the catchment for August 2019 exceeded the available places and a number of pupils, including baptised Roman Catholic children, would not be able to be accommodated. Further information was provided on the placement and ballot process and a previous temporary increase to meet the needs of the then catchment area. Taking account of this information, and following consultation with the head teacher, school

timetabler and the Director of Education, it was agreed that the best way forward for school session 2019/20 would be for the S1 intake to be temporarily increased to accommodate all associated primary school pupils.

In response to questions, the Head of Education Services (Provision and Resources) advised that the school was very well led with an efficient timetable and would be able to cope with a temporary increase to the S1 intake.

The committee agreed:-

- (a) the special circumstances at St. Ninian's High School; and
- (b) to note that the S1 intake would be temporarily increased to 320 places for school session 2019-20 in advance of the planned accommodation being established at the school for 2021-22 to temporarily increase the school's capacity.

## **PROGRESS OF EXPANSION OF EARLY LEARNING AND CHILDCARE**

**886.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of 14 June 2018 (Page 433, Item 466 refers), when progress in relation to the expansion planning for 1140 hours of free Early Learning and Childcare (ELC) for August 2020 was noted, the committee considered a report by the Director of Education providing an update on the progress of the expansion of ELC entitlement to 1140 hours per year for every 3 and 4 year-old child and eligible 2 year-old children by August 2020.

By way of background, the report referred to the Scottish Government's vision to expand ELC provision as outlined above, to be underpinned by the key principles of Quality, Flexibility, Accessibility and Affordability. It explained the steps that had been taken locally to deliver the vision including the establishment of an ELC Expansion Board which reported to the Council's Corporate Management Team, the Board having 4 workstreams with specific remits; Quality; Workforce; Expansion Plan and Service Models; and Provision and Resources.

Thereafter, the report summarised progress across the 4 workstreams and proposed plans moving forward. With regard to the Workforce workstream, it was reported that the first cohort of HNC students participating in the HNC in Childhood Practice with West College Scotland had completed their studies and 14 out of the 19 graduates had secured Child Development Officer posts within East Renfrewshire Council. A second cohort would graduate in May 2019 and a third cohort was underway. Further information was provided regarding the Delivery Models workstream highlighting that the East Renfrewshire Expansion Plan had previously outlined an increase to funded providers from £3.50 per hour to £5.50 from August 2019 onwards. However, a significant shortfall in revenue funding had merited a recalculation of the rate and, taking account of a number of factors, it was proposed that a rate of £5.00 per hour would be applied. Further information would be provided in due course to allow further consideration of hourly rates beyond August 2020. It was further reported that the Scottish Government had released additional "Realising Change" funds to support local authorities in the implementation of the expansion and East Renfrewshire had been awarded a total of £114,320. Guidance suggested that the grant should be used to support local authority and funded providers to transition to 1140 hours and a plan was submitted to the Scottish Government on 29 March with the spending proposal for East Renfrewshire.

With regard to the Provision and Resources workstream, it was explained that the 8-year Capital Plan approved at Council in February 2019 reflected the latest cost estimates for the delivery of the new and extended early years facilities and additional Scottish Government funding of £11.7million had been received towards the expansion over the period of the capital plan. This would include 2 new-build family centres on the sites of Crookfur and Overlee Pavilions; new-build larger replacements for Busby and Eaglesham Primary School nursery classes; and a new-build larger replacement for Glenwood Family Centre. In addition to new and extended facilities, all existing Early Learning and Childcare Centres had been reviewed and a programme of minor works would be taken forward.

In response to comments, the Head of Education Services (Equality and Equity) advised that the funded sector had previously raised concerns about sustainability but she assured members that East Renfrewshire Council was working closely with the sector to overcome any concerns raised and the increased hourly rate for funded suppliers should assist with their sustainability.

The committee:-

- (a) noted the progress regarding East Renfrewshire's expansion planning for 1140 hours of free early learning and childcare for August 2020;
- (b) noted that Crookfur Nursery Class would be relocated to the new facilities at the site of Crookfur Pavilion, operating under the existing management of Crookfur Primary and be known as Crookfur Family Centre from August 2020; and
- (c) approved the increase in the hourly rate for funded providers.

## **EAST RENFREWSHIRE CORPORATE PARENTING PLAN 2016-18 – YEAR 2 PROGRESS REPORT**

**887.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of 17 November 2016 (Page 2113, Item 2271 refers), when the content of the Corporate Parenting Plan 2016-18 was noted, the committee considered a report by the Director of Education providing Year 2 Progress on the Corporate Parenting Plan for the period 2016-18.

The report referred to the role of Community Planning Partners as “corporate parents” providing progress on work which had taken place over the previous two years to deliver the Corporate Parenting Plan. It was reported that looked after children and young people constituted 0.5% of the total children's population of the area and the Corporate Parenting Plan had been developed within the context of the *Getting it Right for Every Child* programme and the SHANARRI wellbeing indicators framework. A number of key improvements had made been including in relation to permanence; raising attainment; and health and wellbeing, with a significant increase being recorded in the performance of looked after children and young people in baseline assessments in numeracy and literacy and with regard to development milestones. Although a number of key improvements had been made to the lives of looked after children and young people, it was noted that there had also been some challenging areas including a slight reduction in attendance rates in school session 2016-17 when compared to the previous year, and less satisfactory figures relating to positive school leaver destinations.

Councillor O’Kane referred to the role that Elected Members had as corporate parents, advising that he attended meetings of the Champions Board where young people had expressed a desire to have a system in place based on love and care, and recognised that educational outcomes were extremely important. Members referred to the collaborative

work which was ongoing across council departments and with other partners in this area, which had led to a number of positive benefits and outcomes for looked after children and young people in recent years.

The committee:-

- (a) acknowledged the progress made in delivering improved outcomes for looked after children, young people and care leavers;
- (b) noted the areas of challenge and potential solutions; and
- (c) directed the East Renfrewshire Corporate Parenting family, listed in appendix 4 of the report, to continue to move forward and work collaboratively to agree future priorities for the coming years.

CHAIR



**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**LICENSING COMMITTEE**

**Minute of Meeting held at 2.00pm in the Committee Room, Council Headquarters, Eastwood Park, Giffnock, on 14 May 2019.**

**Present:**

Councillor Angela Convery (Chair)  
Councillor Betty Cunningham (Vice Chair)

Councillor Charlie Gilbert  
Councillor Stewart Miller

Councillor Convery in the Chair

**Attending:**

Jacqui McCusker, Senior Solicitor; Brian Kilpatrick, Civic Government Enforcement Officer; and Ron Leitch, Committee Services Officer.

**Apology:**

Councillor Alan Lafferty.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**888.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**Resolution to Exclude Press and Public**

At this point in the meeting, on the motion of the Chair, the committee unanimously resolved that in accordance with the provisions of Section 50A(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, as amended, the press and public be excluded from the meeting for the undernoted items of business on the grounds that they involved the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Paragraphs 6 and 14 of Part 1 of Schedule 7A to the Act.

**PRIVATE HIRE CAR DRIVER'S LICENCE – APPLICATION FOR RENEWAL**

**889.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of 16 April 2019 (Page 806, Item 1857 refers) when it had been agreed to defer consideration of an application for renewal of a Private Hire Car Driver's Licence to enable the applicant to make a personal appearance, the committee considered a report by the Chief Officer (Legal & Procurement) in relation to an application for the renewal of a Private Hire Car Driver's Licence (Agenda Item 3 refers).

The applicant was present.

836

The applicant was invited to comment on the application with particular reference to a number of discrepancies within the supporting documentation and to respond to questions from Elected Members.

Following detailed discussion the committee agreed to a short adjournment to consider the matter.

On reconvening, the committee agreed that the application be refused on the grounds that the documentation provided contained a number of major discrepancies which did not support the application.

## **PRIVATE HIRE CAR DRIVER'S LICENCE – APPLICATION FOR RENEWAL**

**890.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of 16 April 2019 (Page 806, Item 1858 refers) when it had been agreed to defer consideration of an application for renewal of a Private Hire Car Driver's Licence to enable the applicant to make a personal appearance, the committee considered a report by the Chief Officer (Legal & Procurement) in relation to an application for the renewal of a Private Hire Car Driver's Licence (Agenda Item 4 refers).

The applicant was present.

The applicant was invited to comment on the application with particular reference to a number of discrepancies within the supporting documentation and to respond to questions from Elected Members.

Following detailed discussion the committee agreed to a short adjournment to consider the matter.

On reconvening, the committee agreed that the application be refused on the grounds that the documentation provided contained a number of major discrepancies which did not support the application.

CHAIR

**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**PLANNING APPLICATIONS COMMITTEE**

**Minute of Meeting held at 2.00pm in the Council Offices, Main Street, Barrhead on 15 May 2019.**

**Present:**

Councillor Annette Ireland (Chair)  
Councillor Betty Cunningham (Vice Chair)  
Councillor Angela Convery

Provost Jim Fletcher  
Councillor Stewart Miller

Councillor Ireland in the Chair

**Attending:**

Sean McDaid, Principal Planner and Derek Scott, Planner, Development Management; and Paul O'Neil, Committee Services Officer.

**Apologies:**

Councillors Jim McLean and Jim Swift.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**891.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**APPLICATION FOR PLANNING PERMISSION**

**892.** The committee considered a report by the Director of Environment, on planning application 2019/0085/TP - Change of use of public house to funeral parlour at the Toby Carvery, Glasgow Road, Hurlet, Barrhead, by Sava Estates.

The Principal Planner summarised the assessment of the proposed development and advised that officers were recommending that the application be approved, subject to the conditions detailed in the report.

Whilst expressing concerns about the congestion on Glasgow Road, Barrhead, Councillor Cunningham commented that the problems were compounded by the additional traffic generated by the significant amount of development that was taking place at various sites in Barrhead including Blackbyres and the former Nestle site. She also noted from the report that it was proposed to erect illuminated signs at the site and highlighted that Glasgow Road was the main route for those travelling to and from the M77, Braehead, and Silverburn shopping centres.

Concluding her remarks, Councillor Cunningham stated that in her opinion, the proposed development would exacerbate the congestion problems that were currently being experienced on Glasgow Road, Barrhead.

Councillor Convery stated that she shared the concerns expressed by Councillor Cunningham about the volume of traffic on Glasgow Road in the course of which she highlighted that given the volume of traffic on the road motorists attempting a right-hand turn from the application site onto Glasgow Road would in her opinion experience problems accessing the road. Concluding her remarks, she sought clarification whether the applicant proposed to extend the footprint of the premises.

In reply, the Principal Planner confirmed that the applicant proposed to use the existing fabric of the building in the course of which plans of the existing and proposed layout of the building were exhibited to the committee. He also explained in response to comments made by Councillor Cunningham that the illuminated signs that were proposed to be erected at the site did not form part of the application under consideration. He advised that this matter was subject of a separate application (i.e. Ref No:- 2019/0247/ADV) and would be dealt with under delegated powers.

Concluding his remarks, the Principal Planner whilst noting the concerns expressed about the difficulties motorists would have turning right from the site onto Glasgow Road emphasised that the Council's Roads Service had offered no objections to the proposed development.

Councillor Cunningham reiterated her early comments regarding the congestion on Glasgow Road, Barrhead.

In response to a question about the operating hours of the funeral parlour, the Principal Planner advised that it was proposed to undertake between 500 and 1000 funerals per year which equated to a maximum of 3 per day. He confirmed that if the committee had concerns about the operating hours proposed by the applicant it could attach a condition to restrict them.

Whilst noting that there were 69 car parking spaces at the site, Provost Fletcher sought clarification whether this would be sufficient to accommodate large numbers attending a funeral. In response, the Principal Planner confirmed that the Council's Roads Service was satisfied with the level of car parking provision at the site.

At this stage, Councillor Ireland, seconded by Councillor Convery, moved that the application be approved, subject to the conditions detailed in the report.

Councillor Cunningham, seconded by Councillor Miller, moved as an amendment that the application be refused on the grounds that the proposed development would result in congestion on the roads at the location and there was a lack of parking provision.

On a vote being taken, two Members voted for the motion and three Members voted for the amendment. The amendment was accordingly declared carried and it was agreed that the application be refused on the grounds that the development would result in congestion on the roads at the location and that there was a lack of parking provision.

**TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING (SCOTLAND) ACT 1997  
AS AMENDED BY THE PLANNING ETC (SCOTLAND) ACT 2006  
PLANNING (LISTED BUILDINGS AND CONSERVATION AREAS) (SCOTLAND) ACT 1997**

Index of applications under the above acts considered by Planning Applications Committee on  
15<sup>th</sup> May 2019

---

**Reference No:** 2019/0085/TP

**Ward:** 1

**Applicant:**

Sava Estates  
2 Glasgow Road  
Hurlet  
Barrhead  
Scotland  
G53 7TG

**Agent:**

Don Bennett  
10 Park Court  
Glasgow  
Scotland  
G46 7PB

**Site:** The Toby Carvery Glasgow Road Hurlet Barrhead East Renfrewshire

**Description:** Change of use of public house to funeral parlour

**Decision:** Refused

---



**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**LOCAL REVIEW BODY**

**Minute of Meeting held at 2.30pm in the Council Offices, Main Street, Barrhead on 15 May 2019.**

**Present:**

Councillor Annette Ireland (Chair)  
Councillor Betty Cunningham  
Councillor Angela Convery

Provost Jim Fletcher  
Councillor Stewart Miller

Councillor Ireland in the Chair

**Attending:**

Julie Nicol, Principal Strategy Officer (Planning Adviser); Siobhan Wilson, Solicitor (Legal Adviser); and Paul O'Neil, Committee Services Officer (Clerk).

**Apologies:**

Councillors Jim McLean and Jim Swift.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**893.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**NOTICE OF REVIEW – REVIEW 2019/04 – SUB-DIVISION OF FEU AND ERECTION OF DWELLINGHOUSE (FRONTING OTTERBURN DRIVE) AT 9 PERCY DRIVE, GIFFNOCK (REF NO: 2018/0764/TP)**

**894.** The Local Review Body considered a report by the Deputy Chief Executive, relative to a 'Notice of Review' submitted by Mr Daniel Modlin, against the decision taken by officers to refuse planning permission in respect of the sub-division of feu and erection of dwellinghouse (fronting Otterburn Drive) at 9 Percy Drive, Giffnock.

The decision had been made in accordance with the Council's Scheme of Delegation made in terms of Section 43A of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 as amended.

In accordance with the decision taken at the meeting on 10 August 2016, the Local Review Body had carried out an unaccompanied site inspection of the application site immediately prior to the meeting.

842

The Local Review Body, having considered the information previously circulated, agreed that it had sufficient information to determine the review without further procedure.

Following discussion, it was agreed to uphold the decision of the Appointed Officer as set out in the decision notice of 4 February 2019 and refuse planning permission.

CHAIR

**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**CABINET**

**Minute of Meeting held at 10.00am in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock on 6 June 2019.**

**Present:**

Councillor Tony Buchanan (Leader)  
Councillor Caroline Bamforth  
Councillor Danny Devlin

Councillor Alan Lafferty  
Councillor Colm Merrick  
Councillor Paul O’Kane

Councillor Buchanan, Leader, in the Chair

**Attending:**

Lorraine McMillan, Chief Executive; Andy Cahill, Director of Environment; Margaret McCrossan, Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer); Andy Corry, Head of Environment (Operations); Gill Darbyshire, Chief Executive’s Business Manager; Stuart Free, Principal Officer (Asset Management); and Paul O’Neil, Committee Services Officer.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**895.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**REVIEW OF THE STRATEGIC RISK REGISTER AND RISK MANAGEMENT PROGRESS**

**896.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of the Cabinet of 5 April 2018 (Page 351, Item 378 refers), when the Cabinet noted the development of the Council’s Strategic Risk Register noting that it was considered a “live” document and would be updated and amended by the Corporate Management Team (CMT) as appropriate, the Cabinet considered a report by the Chief Executive, providing the latest annual update of the Council’s Strategic Risk Register and a summary of risk management progress.

Whilst noting that as part of the review of the register several new risks had been added, some were removed and some others were amended, the report advised that there were now 29 risks on the register of which 9 were classified as “high” risk. Furthermore, the risks captured in the register continued to be monitored and evaluated by the CMT on a regular basis. It was further noted that the register was reported to the Audit and Scrutiny Committee every 6 months and to the Cabinet annually.

The Cabinet noted the updated Strategic Risk Register noting that the document was considered a “live” document and would be updated and amended by the Corporate Management Team (CMT) as appropriate.

**PROPERTY ASSET MANAGEMENT PLAN 2019-21**

**897.** The Cabinet considered a report by the Director of Environment, providing details on the updated Property Asset Management Plan 2019-21. A copy of the plan was appended to the report.

Whilst noting that the new plan supported the delivery of all 5 outcomes in the Community Plan and outlined the work being undertaken by the Council in relation to the management of the 115 non-housing operational properties across the Council's area including schools, offices and leisure trust properties, the report explained that with the continued pressure on budgets and expenditure, asset management was a critical tool in ensuring the Council achieved best value across its corporate estate.

The report indicated that the property data referred to year 2017/18 figures. However, it was noted that the plan would be updated annually to reflect each year's completed data and used to assist decision-making in relation to the property portfolio including property maintenance budgets.

The Cabinet approved the East Renfrewshire Property Asset Management Plan 2019-21.

CHAIR

**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**CABINET**  
**(POLICE AND FIRE)**

**Minute of Meeting held at 10.30 am in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock, on 6 June 2019.**

**Present:**

Councillor Colin Merrick (Chair)  
Councillor Paul O’Kane (Vice Chair)  
Councillor Caroline Bamforth

Councillor Tony Buchanan  
Councillor Barbara Grant  
Councillor Alan Lafferty

Councillor Merrick, in the Chair

**Attending:**

Lorraine McMillan, Chief Executive; Caroline Innes, Deputy Chief Executive; Claire Reid, Community Safety Manager; and Paul O’Neil, Committee Services Officer.

**Also Attending:**

Chief Superintendent Brian McNulty; Superintendent Gary l’Anson and Chief Inspector John McQuilter, Police Scotland; and Local Senior Officer Graeme Binning; and Group Manager Colin Martin, Scottish Fire and Rescue Service.

**Apologies:**

Councillors Danny Devlin and Stewart Miller.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**898.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**POLICE SCOTLAND – PERFORMANCE REPORT OVER THE FOURTH QUARTER OF FINANCIAL YEAR 2018/19**

**899.** The Cabinet considered a report by the Divisional Commander, Police Scotland, providing details of the performance of the police over the fourth quarter of financial year 2018/19. The report also provided statistical information in relation to various categories of crimes and offences committed during the reported period together with comparative statistics for the corresponding period in 2017/18 and against the 5-year average.

Chief Superintendent McNulty began by highlighting the positive nature of the report which demonstrated the strong partnership working that existed within East Renfrewshire in the course of which he emphasised that East Renfrewshire was the safest place to live in Scotland. He advised that he had invited Superintendent I'Anson, Partnerships and Resourcing within the Greater Glasgow Division to attend the meeting to provide details about the proposed introduction of the Contact Assessment Model (CAM) which would become operational in police contact centres later in the year. Concluding his remarks, he advised that he was due to retire in the near future and that his successor would be Chief Superintendent Hazel Hendren who was currently the Divisional Commander for Argyll and West Dunbartonshire. At this stage, he invited Chief Inspector McQuilter to comment on the information contained in the performance report.

Chief Inspector McQuilter reiterated that the figures recorded in the report continued the positive trend previously reported throughout the year. He stated that performance was measured against the five local priorities contained in the East Renfrewshire Policing Plan 2017-20. These were noted as Homes Being Broken Into; Anti-Social Behaviour and Disorder; Violent Crime; Drug Dealing and Misuse; and Child Abuse including Child Sexual Exploitation.

Whilst noting that over the last year the number of victims of domestic house breaking had reduced by 25 compared to the previous year's figures and that there were 42 fewer victims against the 5 year average, Chief Inspector McQuilter provided details of the measures being taken by officers from the Safer Communities Department which had contributed to the overall reduction in this type of crime. He also reported that the number of incidents of anti-social behaviour had decreased by 21% with 565 fewer incidents being recorded compared to the previous year's figures. It was noted that Campus Officers continued to deliver talks to school pupils in partnership with colleagues from the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service to highlight the effects that anti-social behaviour had in the community and that these talks had now been rolled out to include parents' evenings throughout East Renfrewshire.

Commenting on the crimes of violence, Chief Inspector McQuilter reported that the number of victims of violent crime had also fallen over the past year with a 68% detection rate being recorded which was above the 2017 figure and the 5 year average. Whilst noting that there had been a slight increase in the number of common assaults, he reported that the number of domestic abuse incidents had also reduced. In this connection, he commented that officers had undergone training to deal with domestic abuse incidents in terms of the Domestic Abuse (Scotland) Act 2018.

Chief Inspector McQuilter referred to the partnership work that had been undertaken with the Council's Licensing Section it being noted that in March 2019, a temporary suspension of a licensee who was failing to operate their premises in a fit and proper manner had been secured together with a shopkeeper being reported for selling alcohol to underage youths. Details on the number of seizures of a variety of controlled drugs in the final quarter of 2018 together with several arrests that had been made were outlined in the report. Furthermore, this proactivity had resulted in an increase in the number of people being detected for the supply of controlled drugs in the last year and a 24% increase against the 5 year average. It was noted that officers from the Divisional Pro-active Unit had searched an address in the Newton Mearns area and had recovered 2kg of cannabis and 17,000 etizolam tablets.

Turning to the problem of child abuse and child sexual exploitation, Chief Inspector McQuilter reported that in January 2019 local officers had attended at four premises in the Barrhead area with officers from the Home Office Immigration Enforcement which was part of a joint operation to identify people who might have been subject to exploitation or human trafficking. He also reported that in February 2019, Campus Officers had attended additional child protection training arranged by the Health and Social Care Partnership.

Concluding his remarks, Chief Inspector McQuilter commented that in terms of road safety one fatality had been recorded in the course of which he provided details of the work being undertaken by the police in partnership with the Council's Roads and Transportation Service to ensure that specific issues in East Renfrewshire could be addressed. It was further noted that officers from the local problem solving team had delivered inputs to local housing associations to raise awareness of counter terrorism and extremism together with details of how to report instances of concern about behaviour or other things that they had encountered when dealing with the public.

There followed a short question and answer session in the course of which Chief Superintendent McNulty and Chief Inspector McQuilter provided clarification on a range of operational issues within East Renfrewshire and on the crime statistics recorded in the report..

At this stage, Chief Superintendent McNulty invited Superintendent l'Anson to comment on the proposed introduction of the Contact Assessment Model (CAM) to the contact centres.

Superintendent l'Anson provided a brief overview of how the new system would operate highlighting that it would improve the management of calls being made to the police as call handlers would be able to assess the risk to the caller, provide the necessary advice and ensure that appropriate action was taken by officers. It was noted that the new approach would be introduced in phases starting in Lanarkshire and Dumfries and Galloway during the course of the summer before a proposed roll out across Scotland.

The Cabinet:-

- (a) noted the position regarding the introduction of the Contact Assessment Model; and
- (b) otherwise noted the terms of the report.

## **SCOTTISH FIRE AND RESCUE SERVICE (SFRS) PERFORMANCE REPORT FOR FOURTH QUARTER OF 2018/19**

The Cabinet considered a report by the Local Senior Officer, Scottish Fire and Rescue Service (SFRS), providing details of the performance of the SFRS in East Renfrewshire during the fourth quarter of 2018/19. An analysis of the incidents in each of the Council's five wards during the reported period was outlined in the report.

The Local Senior Officer referred to the positive results being reported which demonstrated that East Renfrewshire was a safe place to live. He stated that as previously reported a senior officer was now dedicated to East Renfrewshire area and to strengthen this arrangement he had appointed a local area liaison officer to work in partnership with the local area liaison officer appointed by the police. He also indicated that he was looking to develop the relationship between SFRS and the Scottish Ambulance Service in the course of which he advised that a full-time paramedic service would now operate from Clarkston fire station. He also commented on the arrangements to install defibrillators in the Levern Valley, one of which had been installed at Barrhead fire station.

Concluding his remarks, he stated that the Scottish Fire and Rescue Service Strategic Plan 2019/22 was the subject of a 10 week public consultation which would end on 18 July 2019. A letter providing details about the consultation on the Strategic Plan would be circulated to the Cabinet at the end of the meeting. At this stage, he invited Area Manager Martin to comment further on the terms of the performance report.

Area Manager Martin began by reinforcing the message that East Renfrewshire was a safe place to live highlighting the low levels activity recorded in the last quarter. He referred to the summary of the activity in the report in the course of which it was noted that there had been a 20% reduction recorded in the number of fires and a 24% reduction in the number of fire and non-fire casualties. However, the number of false alarm signals had increased by 12% over the reported period.

Whilst noting that accidental dwelling fires had decreased by a third compared to the same period the previous year, Area Manager Martin stated that this represented an increase on the 3-year average due to low activity being recorded in the preceding two years. It was noted that 17 accidental dwelling fires had been recorded in 2018/19 although in 60% of these incidents no assistance was required from SFRS. It was further noted that there had been no fatalities recorded although there were 5 casualties associated with 3 accidental dwelling fires, details of which were outlined in the report.

Area Manager Martin stated that it was pleasing to note that no water rescue had been required during the reported period and that there were only 8 non-fire casualties recorded during the course of 2018/19. The most serious of these had occurred from a fall in the home environment resulting in a leg fracture. He highlighted that to address this type of event SFRS were working in partnership with East Renfrewshire Falls Team to prevent individuals sustaining similar injuries in the future. He also indicated that there had been a slight increase in deliberate fire setting although a 10% reduction recorded against the 3-year average. It was noted that SFRS continued to work in partnership with Police Scotland in delivering safety messages to school aged children. It was noted that unwanted fire alarm signals had shown a slight increase in activity in this area with residential care facilities replacing educational establishments as the main reporters.

There followed a short question and answer session in the course of which Local Senior Officer Binning and Area Manager Martin provided clarification on a range of operational issues within East Renfrewshire.

The Cabinet noted the position.

CHAIR

**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**LICENSING COMMITTEE**

**Minute of Meeting held at 2.00pm in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Eastwood Park, Giffnock, on 11 June 2019.**

**Present:**

Councillor Angela Convery (Chair)	Councillor Alan Lafferty
Councillor Charlie Gilbert	Councillor Stewart Miller

Councillor Convery in the Chair

**Attending:**

Jacqui McCusker, Senior Solicitor; Brian Kilpatrick, Civic Government Enforcement Officer; and Jennifer Graham, Committee Services Officer.

**Also Attending:**

Inspector Brian McGeoch and Constable Lesley-Ann Stevenson, Police Scotland (Item 902 only).

**Apology:**

Councillor Betty Cunningham (Vice-Chair).

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**901.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**PRIVATE HIRE CAR DRIVER'S LICENCE – APPLICATION FOR GRANT**

**902.** The committee considered a report by the Chief Officer – Legal and Procurement in relation to an application for the grant of a Private Hire Car Driver's Licence (Agenda Item 3 refers).

The applicant was present together with her sister.

Inspector McGeoch and Constable Stevenson representing the Chief Constable who had made an objection in respect of the application were also present.

The report explained that in determining the application it would be for the committee to decide what weight it wished to attach to the objection by the Chief Constable and its relevance to the type of licence being applied for.

Inspector McGeoch was heard in respect of the objection submitted by the Chief Constable and in response to questions from Members.

The applicant was then heard in respect of the application and in response to questions from Members.

The committee, having taken account of the applicant's previous conviction, its seriousness and relevance to the licence being applied for, and also having taken account of the objection by the Chief Constable, agreed that the application be refused on the grounds that the applicant was not a fit and proper person to be the holder of such a licence by virtue of her previous conviction.

### **PRIVATE HIRE CAR OPERATOR'S LICENCE – APPLICATION FOR GRANT**

**903.** The committee considered a report by the Chief Officer – Legal and Procurement in relation to an application for the grant of a Private Hire Car Operator's Licence (Agenda Item 4 refers).

The applicant was present together with Mr Hepburn, a former employee of Arthurlie Taxis.

The reported explained that the applicant had held a Private Hire Car Operator's Licence since 2011, which had been renewed regularly, with the most recent licence having expired on 21 November 2018. Further information was provided on the reason why the applicant had not renewed his licence by the required date, partly due to installation of a new computer system at Arthurlie Taxis which failed to remind him that his licence required to be renewed. Reference was also made to the current policy which required all new Taxi and Private Hire Operator's Licences to operate a Wheelchair Accessible Vehicle (WAV).

The applicant and Mr Hepburn were heard in respect of the application and in response to questions from Members during which the applicant requested special permission not to operate a WAV should the application for a Private Hire Operator's Licence be granted.

The committee, having taken account of the information provided, agreed that:-

- (a) the application for a Private Hire Car Operator's Licence be granted for a period of 1 year; and
- (b) the applicant be granted special permission not to operate a WAV.

CHAIR

**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**LOCAL REVIEW BODY**

**Minute of Meeting held at 2.00pm in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock on 12 June 2019.**

**Present:**

Councillor Angela Convery  
Provost Jim Fletcher

Councillor Stewart Miller

**Attending:**

Graham Shankland, Principal Business Intelligence Officer (Planning Adviser); Joe Abrami, Principal Solicitor (Legal Adviser); and Paul O'Neil, Committee Services Officer (Clerk).

**Apologies:**

Councillors Annette Ireland (Chair); Betty Cunningham (Vice Chair); Jim McLean; and Jim Swift.

**APPOINTMENT OF CHAIR**

In the absence of the Chair and Vice Chair, it was agreed that Provost Fletcher chair the meeting.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**904.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**NOTICE OF REVIEW – REVIEW 2019/06 – ERECTION OF ONE AND A HALF STOREY REAR EXTENSION WITH INCREASE IN RIDGE HEIGHT AND INSTALLATION OF DORMER WINDOWS AT FRONT AND REAR AT 44 EAGLESHAM ROAD, CLARKSTON (REF NO: 2018/0739/TP)**

**905.** The Local Review Body considered a report by the Deputy Chief Executive, relative to a 'Notice of Review' submitted by Mr Martin Connor, against the decision taken by officers to refuse planning permission in respect of the erection of a one and a half storey rear extension with increase in ridge height and installation of dormer windows at front and rear at 44 Eaglesham Road, Clarkston.

The decision had been made in accordance with the Council's Scheme of Delegation made in terms of Section 43A of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 as amended.

In accordance with the decision taken at the meeting on 10 August 2016, the Local Review Body had carried out an unaccompanied site inspection of the application site immediately prior to the meeting.

Having been advised that the applicant had submitted new evidence which was not before the Appointed Officer at the time that the determination of the application was made and having noted the procedure that required to be followed should the new information be taken into account, the Local Review Body decided not to give consideration to the new information in the determination of the review.

At this stage, the Local Review Body, having considered the information previously circulated, agreed that it had sufficient information to determine the review without further procedure.

Following discussion, it was agreed that the decision of the Appointed Officer as set out in the decision notice of 7 March 2019 be overturned and that planning permission be granted.

**NOTICE OF REVIEW – REVIEW 2019/08 – ERECTION OF ONE AND A HALF STOREY REAR EXTENSION WITH INSTALLATION OF DORMER WINDOWS AT SIDE; INSTALLATION OF HIPPED ROOF OVER DORMER WINDOW AT FRONT AT 73 BEECH AVENUE, NEWTON MEARNES (REF NO: 2019/0152/TP)**

**906.** The Local Review Body considered a report by the Deputy Chief Executive, relative to a 'Notice of Review' submitted by Mr and Mrs J Fitzpatrick, against the decision taken by officers to refuse planning permission in respect of the proposed erection of a one and a half storey rear extension with installation of dormer windows at side; installation of hipped roof over dormer window at front at 73 Beech Avenue, Newton Mearns.

The decision had been made in accordance with the Council's Scheme of Delegation made in terms of Section 43A of the Town and Country Planning (Scotland) Act 1997 as amended.

In accordance with the decision taken at the meeting on 10 August 2016, the Local Review Body had carried out an unaccompanied site inspection of the application site immediately prior to the meeting.

Having been advised that the applicants had submitted new evidence which was not before the Appointed Officer at the time that the determination of the application was made and having noted the procedure that required to be followed should the new information be taken into account, the Local Review Body decided not to give consideration to the new information in the determination of the review.

At this stage, the Local Review Body, having considered the information previously circulated, agreed that it had sufficient information to determine the review without further procedure.

Following discussion, it was agreed to overturn the decision of Appointed Officer as set out in the decision notice of 7 May 2019 and grant planning permission, subject to a standard condition relating to external materials being attached to the planning permission.

**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**EDUCATION COMMITTEE**

**Minute of Meeting held at 10.00am in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock on 13 June 2019.**

**Present:**

Councillor Paul O’Kane (Chair)	Councillor Gordon Wallace
Councillor Colm Merrick (Vice Chair)	Dr Frank Angell
Councillor Tony Buchanan (Leader)	Ms Mary McIntyre
Councillor Charlie Gilbert	Mr Des Morris

Councillor O’Kane in the Chair

**Attending:**

Mhairi Shaw, Director of Education; Janice Collins, Head of Education Services (Equality and Equity); Fiona Morrison, Head of Education Services (Provision and Resources); Mark Ratter, Head of Education Services (Quality Improvement and Performance); Tracy Morton, Education Senior Manager; and Ron Leitch, Committee Services Officer.

**Also Attending:**

John Docherty, Head Teacher, St Ninian’s High School; Sarah Clark, Head Teacher, Isobel Mair School; Yvonne Donaldson, Head Teacher, Netherlee Primary School; Stuart Maxwell, Head Teacher, Eastwood High School; and Kathleen McGuire, Quality Improvement Officer.

**Apologies:**

Councillors Caroline Bamforth, Alan Lafferty and Jim McLean; and Ms Dorothy Graham.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**907.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**EDUCATION SCOTLAND REPORT ON ST. NINIAN’S HIGH SCHOOL**

**908.** The committee considered a report by the Director of Education informing members of the report by Education Scotland following their inspection of St Ninian’s High School. A copy of the inspection report accompanied the report.

The Head of Education Services (Quality Improvement and Performance) explained that in assessing the quality indicators in the school, Education Scotland had evaluated 2 of the 4 indicators as excellent and the other 2 indicators as very good.

Key strengths were highlighted including, amongst others, the climate of aspirations in the school underpinned by gospel values, the Catholic faith, mutual respect and nurturing relationships; the motivation and determination of the young people to flourish in a wide range of situations and their great respect for learning; and the highly effective leadership of all staff, their teamwork and commitment to undertaking a range of professional learning.

He went on to explain that this was an outstanding report with the judgements made by Education Scotland being very close to the department's evaluation of the quality of provision. St Ninian's was the first secondary school in Scotland to achieve an evaluation of excellent for raising attainment and achievement. The department was particularly pleased that the leadership of the Head Teacher had been noted in the letter to parents/carers as one of the key strengths.

The inspection team had agreed one area for improvement with the school and the department. However, given that the school had been judged to be excellent in two of the indicators assessed, there was no need for an additional action plan to address the area for improvement. The school would continue to use the results of its own self-evaluation to identify priorities for improvement which would be published in its annual standards and quality report and school plan.

Education Scotland would make no further reports in connection with the inspection of St Ninian's High School and the department recommended that the school be accredited for its achievements. This would mean that the authority would not carry out any formal quality assurance activities in St Ninian's High School for a period of 3 years from the date of publication of the report.

A number of members, including Councillors O'Kane and Buchanan, expressed their congratulations to the whole school community for achieving such an outstanding report with particular mention being given to the dedication shown by all staff, the support of parents and carers and the hard work of the young people who attended the school. The Director explained that she intended to meet with all of the staff of the school prior to the summer recess with a view to congratulating them on their contribution to such an excellent report.

Mr Docherty, Head Teacher, explained that he was extremely proud of the report, which had been achieved through the hard work and commitment of the entire school community. He thanked the Education Department Directorate and the committee for their continued support and undertook to pass on the committee's congratulations and comments to all staff and pupils.

Having heard Councillor O'Kane, on behalf of the committee, commend all of those involved in achieving an excellent report, the committee agreed to:-

- (a) note the content of the Education Scotland report on St Ninian's High School; and
- (b) commend the school's achievements by awarding it accreditation from May 2019 until May 2022.

## **GAELIC LANGUAGE PLAN**

**909.** The committee considered a report by the Director of Education providing an update on progress with the Gaelic Language Plan for East Renfrewshire Council.

The report explained that the draft East Renfrewshire Gaelic Language Plan 2015 – 2019 had been developed following consultation with colleagues across the Council and with support from the nominated officer from the Bord na Gaidhlig. The updated Gaelic Language Plan 2017 – 2022, a copy of which accompanied the report, had been prepared following feedback from Bord na Gaidhlig with timescales amended accordingly.

The Head of Education Services (Quality Improvement and Performance) explained that a corporate working group had been set up to support the Council to implement, monitor and report on progress with the plan. The group comprised officers from the Education, Environment and Corporate and Community Services departments. He concluded by explaining that the plan would be monitored on an annual basis with a report being submitted to the committee. A copy of the report would be sent to the Bord na Gaidhlig for information.

Councillor O’Kane explained that, as the plan had implications across the wider Council, following discussion by the committee it would be appropriate to remit it to the Cabinet for final approval.

Councillor Buchanan explained that the development of the plan had been undertaken in line with Scottish Government policy and he looked forward to seeing future reports on progress as previously stated.

Responding to a comment by Councillor Wallace in relation to possible equalities implications of the plan, Councillor O’Kane explained that Gaelic was recognised in legislation as a national language and expressed the view that discussion on the issue of equalities would be more appropriate when the plan was remitted to the Cabinet for approval.

Thereafter the committee agreed to:-

- (a) note the updated content and timescales of the Gaelic Language Plan for East Renfrewshire; and
- (b) remit the plan to the Cabinet for final approval.

## **EARLY LEARNING AND CHILDCARE ANNUAL REPORT**

**910.** The committee considered a report by the Director of Education providing an update on the approaches taken to develop Early Learning and Childcare (ELC) services, and outlining the steps taken to improve further the quality, flexibility, accessibility and affordability of provision and experiences for young children.

The report explained that the department’s Early Learning and Childcare Strategy 2016 – 2020 detailed how quality would be at the heart of service delivery through investment in people to ensure a highly skilled and motivated workforce equipped to deliver high quality early learning and childcare; the provision of more support for parents; and the reduction in the achievement gap in early development for the most disadvantaged children. This emphasis on quality had been reiterated in the department’s paper “Advancing Excellence and Equity in Education in East Renfrewshire” which recognised the contribution of high quality ELC that improved outcomes, reduced or prevented the need for future intervention and was delivered by a highly qualified and skilled workforce, as being fundamental to achieving the department’s vision of “Everyone Attaining, Everyone Achieving through Excellent Experiences”.

The Head of Education Services (Equality and Equity) explained that the report came at a time of considerable focus on early years both locally and nationally. She went on to highlight a few key areas including, amongst others, the consistent picture of good and very good evaluations by the Care Inspectorate in respect of the department's ELC settings and those who worked in partnership with the department; the increase in the proportion of children achieving their developmental milestones across all Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation (SIMD) deciles which had contributed to a reduction in the attainment gap between those from the most and least affluent deciles from around 26% in 2014-15 to 14% in 2018-19; and the figure of 34% of the current early years workforce holding or working towards a graduate level qualification compared to the national figure of 19%.

She went on to highlight the changes in the pattern of access across the area arising from the increased flexibility offered to parents; the number of parents seeking to defer their child's entry to primary school; and the criteria used by the department in determining the outcome of such requests.

Councillor Buchanan welcomed another very positive report which demonstrated that the department was delivering for parents and looked forward to seeing the impact of the Council's investment in new and upgraded ELC facilities and the rollout of the increase in entitlement from 600 to 1140 hours.

Responding to a comment from Councillor Wallace regarding the aspiration of having a fully graduate workforce in ELC and the support available to staff to help them achieve this, the Head of Education Services (Equality and Equity) explained that all teachers and promoted staff in ELC were currently qualified to graduate level and that financial support was made available to those staff wishing to study for a graduate qualification. However, as a result the Council experienced some leakage of staff to promoted posts in other authorities.

In response to a question from Councillor Merrick regarding the number of requests received annually from parents seeking to defer their child's entry to primary school and the criteria used to determine these requests, the Head of Education Services (Equality and Equity) briefly outlined the processes and procedures used but emphasised that the department would only agree to fund such a request if it believed that deferral was in the best interest of the child. The Director explained that the number of requests for deferral each year was fairly low and offered to provide detailed information directly to Councillor Merrick outwith the meeting.

Following further brief discussion the committee agreed to note the report and related comments.

## **PRESENTATION - EVERYONE ATTAINING, EVERYONE ACHIEVING THROUGH EXCELLENT EXPERIENCES - ROLE OF THE QUALITY IMPROVEMENT TEAM**

**911.** Councillor O'Kane introduced Kathleen McGuire, Quality Improvement Officer (QIO); Sarah Clark, Yvonne Donaldson and Stuart Maxwell, Head Teachers at Isobel Mair School, Netherlee Primary School and Eastwood High School respectively, and invited them to make a short presentation to the committee on the role of the Quality Improvement Team (QIT).

Ms McGuire outlined the 4 key objectives of the QIT, namely raising standards through the conduct of regular quality assurance visits and providing help and support to schools to enable them to get ready for formal Education Scotland inspections; help in understanding how best to make use of the analysis and evaluation of available data; help and encouragement to staff to pursue their own further professional learning; and providing

support and challenge to link establishments. She concluded by inviting the 3 Head Teachers present to outline a number of practical examples of the assistance provided to them by the QIT.

Ms Donaldson outlined the assistance she had received in making best use of key quality improvement documents and how this had assisted her in conducting the school's own self-evaluation process prior to formal reviews and inspections conducted by the QIT and Education Scotland. She also explained how the QIT had challenged her to continually refresh systems within the school and how to include pupils and staff members in driving improvement. She concluded by explaining how the QIT had supported her and her staff in understanding and analysing data for use in driving continuous improvement and how they had worked in partnership to devise a tool which could be used to track the wider achievements of pupils.

Ms Clark outlined the role of the QIT in supporting the wider school cluster and its role in assisting individual schools to conduct their own self-evaluation to support improvement, and their role as critical friends and pastoral supporters. She commended their depth of understanding of the additional support needs (ASN) of many of her pupils and the changing role of the Head Teacher. She concluded by highlighting the opportunities which will be available through the West Partnership (Glasgow City Region Improvement Collaborative).

Mr Maxwell concluded the presentation by outlining the key areas of support and challenge from the QIT from the secondary school perspective including data support and its impact on timetabling and attainment; partnership working and the breadth of curriculum choice including vocational courses, college links, Developing the Young Workforce, and providing maximum opportunity and choice for students; the moderation of standards across schools; and the provision of a quality assurance system. He illustrated the success of the Council's emphasis on education by showing a table derived from SQA data showing that East Renfrewshire students had obtained the best results of any Scottish local authority in the percentage of National 5 awards at grades A – C as a percentage of entries, surpassed only by the independent sector.

Responding to a question from Councillor Wallace regarding what lessons, if any, could be learned from the independent sector in terms of SQA examination success rates, the Director explained that a direct comparison could not be made as the independent sector still operated a selection policy whilst local authorities did not. However, she explained that the department could always learn from best practice regardless of the sector from which it came.

Councillor Buchanan expressed the view that, on a like-for-like basis, most of East Renfrewshire's inclusive schools would outperform many schools in the independent sector. Mr Maxwell added that a number of senior pupils exited the independent sector to attend East Renfrewshire schools in order to take advantage of the broader choice of subjects available.

Councillor O'Kane commended the presenters on an excellent and informative presentation and indicated that it had given him a much greater appreciation of the breadth of work carried out by the QIT and its impact on the education of children and young people in East Renfrewshire.

The committee noted the presentation and the comments made.



**MINUTE**  
**of**  
**AUDIT & SCRUTINY COMMITTEE**

**Minute of Meeting held at 2.00pm in the Council Chamber, Council Headquarters, Giffnock on 20 June 2019.**

**Present:**

Councillor Stewart Miller (Chair)  
Councillor Barbara Grant (Vice Chair)  
Provost Jim Fletcher

Councillor Charlie Gilbert  
Councillor Annette Ireland

Councillor Miller in the Chair

**Attending:**

Margaret McCrossan, Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer); Michelle Blair, Chief Auditor; Andrew Corry, Head of Operations; Barbara Clark, Chief Accountant; John Buchanan, Operations Manager; Stephen Fraser, Corporate Policy Assistant; Linda Hutchison, Clerk to the Committee; Charlie Leleux, Scrutiny and Evaluation Officer; and Jennifer Graham, Committee Services Officer.

**Also Attending:**

John Cornett and Morven Fraser, Audit Scotland.

**Apology:**

Councillor Jim Swift.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**912.** There were no declarations of interest intimated.

**CHAIR'S REPORT**

**913.** The Chair reported that, following on from discussions at the committee in March on the External Audit Plan and in line with suggested good practice, he had met with Elaine Barrowman and Morven Fraser of External Audit on 20 May. He clarified that this was not to discuss any particular issues but rather, as in 2018, it had provided a useful opportunity for both the external auditors and him to discuss various issues regarding external audit work and that of the committee on a less formal basis than would be the case at one of the committee's formal meetings.

The committee noted the position.

## CODE OF CORPORATE GOVERNANCE

**914.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of 21 June 2018 (Page 453, Item 482 refers), when the Code of Corporate Governance updates and actions for 2018/19 had been approved, the committee considered a report by the Deputy Chief Executive on progress against improvement actions since then and seeking approval of a revised code for 2019/20.

The report reiterated the Council's responsibilities for the conduct of its business, defined what the Code of Corporate Governance was, and explained that the proposed updates took account of guidance from the Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy (CIPFA) and Society of Local Authority Chief Executives (SOLACE). The report referred to key requirements with which the Council had to comply and summarised progress on 2018/19 actions, highlighting that five of the six improvement activities listed in the 2018/19 Code had been completed. It was clarified that work on the new Anti-Fraud, Bribery and Theft Strategy had been completed in line with the CIPFA "Code of Practice on Managing the Risk of Fraud and Corruption" and that an annual report on fraud would be submitted for approval in 2020 to ensure full compliance.

The updated Code of Corporate Governance for 2019/20, setting out arrangements which fulfilled the seven governance principles outlined in national guidance, was included as an appendix to the report. Self-assessment against nationally prescribed criteria had found the Council to be fully compliant across all principles. This was with the exception of being partially compliant under the principle of behaving with integrity, demonstrating strong commitment to ethical values and respecting the rule of law, specifically the sub-principle of ensuring corruption and misuse of power are dealt with effectively; and also the principle of managing risks and performance through robust internal control and strong financial management, specifically the sub-principle on ensuring effective counter-fraud and anti-corruption arrangements. Regarding these, work on the new Anti-Fraud, Bribery and Theft Strategy was underway to ensure full compliance by mid-2020.

Having itemised actions to be taken in 2019/20 to further improve compliance with the Code and commented on the Annual Governance Statement to be published in the 2018/19 Annual Report and Accounts, the report concluded that the Council was governed by sound and effective internal management controls and continued to demonstrate compliance with the requirements of the CIPFA/SOLACE framework *Delivering Good Governance in Local Government*. Progress on planned actions for 2018/19 had been posted on the Council's website, as would the 2019/20 Code, subject to it being approved by the committee.

The Corporate Policy Assistant highlighted key issues within the report during which he commented on requirements with which the Council had to comply, the extent of the compliance against nationally prescribed criteria, and the actions to be taken to further improve compliance with the Code in 2019/20. The Head of Accountancy added that the new Anti-Fraud, Bribery and Theft Strategy referred to in the report had just been considered by the Corporate Management Team which evidenced that work on this was progressing.

The committee:-

- (a) noted progress on the 2018/19 Code of Corporate Governance improvement actions; and
- (b) approved the Code of Corporate Governance updates and actions for 2019/20.

## UNAUDITED ANNUAL ACCOUNTS 2018/19

**915.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of 14 March 2019 (Page 782, Item 834 refers), when the 2018/19 Annual Audit Plan and timetable for the publication of related documents had been noted, the committee considered a report by the Head of Accountancy (Chief Financial Officer) on the unaudited Annual Accounts for 2018/19 which had been submitted for audit to Audit Scotland and which were attached for consideration in line with the Local Authority Accounts (Scotland) Regulations 2014.

It was reported that the financial position of the Council remained satisfactory. As the Council had operated comfortably within budget, there had been no need to draw down £1,355k from reserves as planned. It was clarified that transfers totalling £2,734k had been made from the General Fund balance to the Non-Earmarked Reserve, Modernisation Fund, Equalisation Reserve, Feasibility Fund, Capital Reserve, and Repairs and Renewal Fund. The Council's Non-Earmarked General Fund as at 31 March 2019 had been increased by £384k to £10,517k, representing 4.3% of the annual budgeted net revenue expenditure. Although this was slightly above the Council's most prudent target of 4%, the balance would reduce significantly as the Council had budgeted to use £4,312k of this reserve during 2019/20.

Reference was made to the proposed establishment of a Feasibility Fund to permit early preparation and investigations for potential capital projects to be undertaken, and enable a faster start to be made on major new capital schemes as work to identify design and ground condition issues could be taken forward in advance of formal approval of the Capital Plan.

It was confirmed that £41,187k of capital expenditure had been invested. There had also been an operating surplus of £89k on the Housing Revenue Account which had increased the accumulated surplus balance to carry forward to £1,718k.

The Head of Accountancy commented on the volume of work involved in preparing the Accounts in advance of the due date, thanking officers in the Accountancy Section, across departments, and particularly the Chief Accountant, for their contribution to this achievement, especially as some officers were currently seconded to the Core Systems Project Team.

Whilst referring to key aspects of the report, the Chief Accountant also commented on the submission of the unaudited Accounts at this stage of the year which it was hoped was helpful. She highlighted the position on reserves, including the use of £8.5m from the Capital Reserve and the introduction of the new Feasibility Fund. Having quantified the level of funds borrowed to help fund the Capital Programme, she drew attention to a prior year adjustment to correct the valuations of the Council's housing stock which had arisen from a misunderstanding between Housing and Property and Technical Services regarding the calculation of the Social Discount Factor and resulted in these being overstated. This did not impact on Council rent or Council Tax levels and, in future, working papers were to be passed to Accountancy Services for checking to prevent a recurrence.

Finally, commenting on notes to the Group Accounts, she clarified that it was the East Renfrewshire Culture and Leisure Trust's unaudited Accounts for the year to 31 March 2019 that were available from the Chief Executive of the Trust rather than the audited Accounts as has been stated, that any other required changes would be identified during the auditing process, and that a report on the Audited Accounts would be submitted to the committee in September.

Having heard Councillor Miller and other Elected Members thank all of the officers involved in preparing the Accounts and submitting them to this meeting, making reference to the section of the Accounts on consultation and communication with the authority's workforce,

Councillor Grant referred to the challenge of gathering candid survey feedback from officers on issues. In response, the Head of Accountancy referred to the new i-Matter initiative in its first year of implementation, related timescales and the production of team action plans which would not only be useful in themselves, but would also help address concerns expressed that actions taken in response to staff views were not necessarily clear.

Whilst commenting on the value of adding funds to reserves and congratulating officers for achieving this which contributed to the Council's future financial stability, Provost Fletcher also referred to the value of expenditure on good public services and pressures that could be experienced by officers to achieve savings. He added that there could be times when there might be a need to consider further investment in services which had faced cuts if such pressures became too severe.

The committee agreed to note the content of the unaudited Annual Accounts for 2018/19 and that a report on the final Accounts and related documents would be submitted to the committee in September.

## **ARBORICULTURAL FRAMEWORK**

**916.** The committee considered a report by the Director of Environment on matters arising from the Council's Arboricultural Framework Agreement between 1 March and 20 October 2017, and subsequent actions taken in response.

The report explained why framework agreements were awarded for some products or services, commenting on related benefits and best practice where multiple suppliers were used to rank suppliers and ensure transparency in which supplier was chosen for each piece of work. Having made reference to careful consideration and stringent procurement processes applied to awarding ranked frameworks and related issues, it was specified that the first ranked contractor always had to be contacted when a piece of work was to be undertaken. Only if that supplier could not meet requirements, was the second or third ranked contractor contacted.

A recognised framework to support procurement of arboricultural works by the Council had been established to ensure best value and transparency. The ranked order of three contractors as at 1 March 2017 was specified. Following publication of an internal audit report on risk management and corporate governance, in October 2017 senior management in the Environment Department had reviewed the contract to ensure protocols were being followed, through which concerns became apparent about the allocation of works orders. The Director of Environment had reported this urgently to the Chief Auditor who had referred to this briefly at the committee's meeting in January 2018.

Reference was made to investigations conducted first by internal audit, secondly in accordance with the Council's disciplinary procedures, and action taken by the Head of Operations immediately to suspend all further tree works pending them being assessed and confirmed compliant with procurement procedures. The internal audit work had identified that an estimated £50k of excess cost had been incurred by incorrectly awarding work to the second ranked contractor. The disciplinary investigation had found that 95% of work orders totalling £275k had been allocated to that contractor, with both investigations therefore confirming a lack of compliance with procedures resulting in best value not being achieved and additional costs being incurred.

Reference was also made to a request from the first ranked contractor to investigate the awarding of orders to the second ranked contractor and a related claim submitted by the company's solicitors which was ultimately settled at £102k but not covered by the Council's

insurers. The cost had been absorbed within the 2018/19 Neighbourhood Services budget and did not affect the 2019/20 Parks budget, in addition to which an estimated £50k of excess costs had been incurred due to malpractice.

It was clarified that the delay reporting this matter to the committee was linked to the ongoing disciplinary case, the financial claim against the Council and Employment Tribunal proceedings. Related information was provided on the final outcome of the disciplinary action taken against the individual responsible and the Employment Tribunal. As a result of the breach internal processes and procedures had been reviewed to mitigate any risk of recurrence, enhanced checks and protocols had been established, and all of the Internal Audit recommendations made had been accepted as reflected in the Action Plan appended to the report.

Whilst commenting on what had happened and highlighting key aspects of the report and action taken, the Operations and Operations Manager expressed dismay and apologised that the issue had arisen and regarding the associated financial impact, expressing confidence that implementation of the recommendations made which had been accepted would reduce the risk of this happening again.

Whilst speaking in support of the action taken and expressing disappointment regarding the employee's actions, Provost Fletcher commented that the report was silent on the employee's motivation and asked if the matter had been referred to the Police in case criminal activity had taken place. The Chief Auditor confirmed she had contacted the Police at an early stage on 1 November 2017 who had been involved at various stages of proceedings, but that she did not know if they were taking further action.

In response to Councillor Grant and Councillor Ireland, the Operations Manager referred to the redesign of the service and the involvement of more people in it now which helped reduced the risk of such an issue reoccurring. Councillor Grant added that as well as the financial cost to the Council, its reputation had been damaged. Councillor Ireland welcomed how seriously the matter had been taken, expressing regret that there had been a cost to the Council. Checks now done both before and after each piece of arboricultural work was undertaken were commented on.

The committee noted the report and subsequent actions taken on behalf of the Council.

## **EAST RENFREWSHIRE COUNCIL MANAGEMENT REPORT 2018/19**

**917.** The committee considered a report on the publication by the Council's External Auditor of a local report entitled *East Renfrewshire Council Management Report 2018/19* which under the committee's specialisation arrangements fell within the remit of Councillors Miller and Grant for review.

The report summarised key issues identified during the interim audit work carried out. This work included testing of key controls within financial systems to gain assurance over the processes and systems used in preparing the Annual Accounts, the results of which would be considered by the External Auditor during the audit of the 2018/19 Accounts. Having outlined the External Auditor's responsibilities, the report clarified that testing during 2018/19 covered key controls in a number of areas including bank reconciliations; payroll validation and exception reporting; authorisation of journals; change of supplier bank details; and IT access controls. Controls were also tested on budget monitoring and control; feeder system reconciliations; and controls for preventing and detecting fraud in areas such as taxation receipts, welfare benefits, grants and other claims. Other issues commented on included the

outcome of the assessment of the Council's Internal Audit function, the use made by External Audit of Internal Audit work to avoid duplication of resource and effort, and observations concerning the operation of the Audit and Scrutiny Committee.

No significant control weaknesses had been identified, which would enable the External Auditor to take planned assurance for the audit of the 2018/19 Annual Accounts. However, as itemised and summarised in Exhibit 1 of the report, several areas had been identified where controls could be strengthened further. It was commented that progress had been made on actions agreed in the External Auditor's 2017/18 Management Report, but that there were a number of areas raised within that report where progress had been limited.

Whilst reviewing and summarising the key findings and related action to be taken, Mr Cornett confirmed that the report represented the outcome of the external auditor's interim audit work for the year and that no significant control weaknesses had been identified. Having highlighted that the key findings and related action plan covered some issues where progress had been limited, he acknowledged the new target dates for action to progress these in Exhibit 1 and clarified that related progress would be reviewed. He referred to the assurance placed on Internal Audit's work and commented on the importance of the committee's work being progressed in an apolitical manner, encouraging it to do so. He also encouraged the committee to monitor the implementation of the actions within the Management report.

Councillor Grant supported the comments made on the importance of the committee adopting an apolitical approach which she had raised previously. In reply to Councillor Ireland, the Head of Accountancy confirmed that action had already been taken to address the issue raised within the report on staff leavers, referring to reminders which HR now sent to departments on a 4-weekly basis to help ensure appropriate action was taken, the leavers checklist which officers were being reminded to complete, and action taken if unavoidably payroll had not been notified timeously about employees leaving the authority. Mr Cornett referred to the importance of minimising such occurrences and of managers implementing the action agreed on this.

The committee agreed to note the report.

## **NATIONAL EXTERNAL AUDIT REPORT – LOCAL GOVERNMENT IN SCOTLAND – CHALLENGES AND PERFORMANCE 2019**

**918.** The committee considered a report by the Clerk on the publication by Audit Scotland of a report entitled *Local Government in Scotland – Challenges and Performance 2019* which under the committee's specialisation arrangements had been sent to Councillor Miller and Councillor Grant for review. The Head of Communities, Revenues and Change had provided comments on it and a copy of her feedback was attached to the report.

The report explained that the comments provided were high level ones on the Council's position regarding the Accounts Commission report, that report being an annual one overviews the conclusions of a range of Audit Scotland reports from the past year and providing a comprehensive review of challenges and performance issues facing local government in Scotland. Having referred to the value of the report and how it linked well to the Council's requirements under Best Value, it was highlighted that the issues raised within it were ones the Council recognised and was working to address.

Having itemised various recommendations within the report and the challenges of responding to one so wide-ranging, the report emphasised that the content and messages within it were all relevant locally and had been covered with Members in a variety of ways, including through the submission of reports to the Cabinet and the Audit and Scrutiny

Committee, a range of which were itemised in the Appendix to the report. A summary of the Council's 'Strategy on a Page' and a draft PEST analysis documenting political, economic, social and technological themes that would affect the Council in future were also provided.

It was concluded that the Council fully recognised the challenges documented in the Accounts Commission's report, was not complacent and was working to address these in various ways. It was argued that coverage of key issues throughout the year as part of day-to-day business provided strong evidence and assurance that the Council was well positioned across a wide range of issues highlighted, and suggested that the committee could consider the report and issues and themes therein as part of its annual work programme to guide areas where it would find value in a more detailed response to enable further discussion and scrutiny.

The committee, having heard the Clerk confirm that it was always an option for the committee to request that officers attend any of its meetings to discuss any external audit report published and related feedback in more depth, noted the report and comments made.

## **NATIONAL EXTERNAL AUDIT REPORT – HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE INTEGRATION – UPDATE ON PROGRESS**

**919.** The committee considered a report by the Clerk on the publication by Audit Scotland of a report entitled *Health and Social Care Integration – Update on Progress* which under the committee's specialisation arrangements had been sent to Provost Fletcher and Councillor Gilbert for review. The Chief Officer, East Renfrewshire Integration Joint Board (IJB) had provided comments on it and a copy of her feedback was attached to the report.

The report provided details of the proposed actions in response to the External Audit report and the Ministerial Strategic Group report *Review of Progress with Integration of Health and Social Care Final Report*, details of which were appended to the report. Having commented on related issues, including how the work had been progressed and the conclusions within the Audit Scotland report, the report explained that the Scottish Government and COSLA had developed a self-evaluation tool to support IJBs and partners assess their position in relation to the review proposals and Audit Scotland recommendations. Partners had been asked to rate themselves against 22 of the 25 proposals, identify evidence to support their conclusions, and develop proposed improvement actions in respect of each proposal.

It was clarified that the draft self-evaluation had been developed by the IJB Chief Officer following discussion with the IJB Chair, Vice-Chair, Third Sector and Carer representatives and Chief Financial Officer prior to being shared at the IJB meeting on 1 May 2019. IJB members had endorsed the draft self-evaluation, subject to additional comments and agreed that it be remitted to the Chief Officer to reach a consensus view on the evaluation ratings and any improvement actions with the Chief Executives of NHSGGC and the Council prior to its submission to the Integration Review Leadership Group, the final draft having been submitted on 14 May 2019.

It was concluded that the review of progress with integration of health and social care made a number of helpful proposals about actions that could be taken at both a national and local level to tackle the challenges and ensuring the success of integration. The actions required for East Renfrewshire to address the recommendations and proposals resulting from the Audit Scotland report and the Ministerial Strategic Group report were provided as set out in Appendix to the report.

The committee, having heard the Clerk in respect of the report, noted the report.

## **REVIEW OF INTERNAL AUDIT CHARTER**

**920.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of 18 August 2016 (Page 2009, Item 2147 refers), when the revised Internal Audit Charter had been approved, the committee considered a report by the Chief Auditor seeking approval of further revisions to it.

It was clarified that the Charter should be reviewed periodically to ensure it remained fit for purpose. Following a recent review, it had been considered appropriate to make some minor changes to the content to refer to the most current documents; current wording within financial regulations; and the responsibilities of the Corporate Management Team.

The committee agreed to approve the revised Internal Audit Charter.

## **PUBLIC SECTOR INTERNAL AUDIT STANDARDS INTERNAL SELF-ASSESSMENT**

**921.** The committee considered a report by the Chief Auditor regarding progress in relation to compliance with the Public Sector Internal Audit Standards (PSIAS).

The report explained that PSIAS came into force in 2013 and included a requirement that the Head of Internal Audit would develop and maintain a quality assurance and improvement programme (QAIP) to allow assessment against the PSIAS. In addition to regular self-assessment, there was a requirement for an external assessment to be carried out at least once every 5 years by an independent assessor. It was further reported that compliance was mandatory for internal auditors in the public sector, with any areas of non-conformance requiring to be reported to the Audit and Scrutiny Committee.

The report commented further on the QAIP, options appraisal for external assessment, the self-assessment which had most recently been carried out in May 2019, and related results. The self-assessment had indicated that the internal audit team were 95% fully compliant with the relevant standards and partially compliant with a further 4% on the basis of which it had been concluded therefore that it operated in general compliance with the PSIAS. This result was also reflected in the external assessment which concluded that the internal audit service was fully compliant in 11 out of 13 sections and generally compliant in the remaining 2.

Whilst commenting further on the report, regarding options appraisal for external assessment, the Chief Auditor referred to the reciprocal arrangements set up by the Scottish Local Authority Chief Internal Auditors Group (SLACIAG) for councils which wished to participate in providing PSIAS compliant external assessments for each other and related benefits, confirming that East Renfrewshire had pursued this option for the first external assessment in 2018. It was proposed that this option be pursued again for the next 5 year cycle in the interests of Best Value and confirmed that the QAIP appended to the report included actions from both the most recent self-assessment and external assessment.

The committee:-

- (a) noted the outcome of the revised self-assessment; and
- (b) approved continued participation in the reciprocal SLACIAG independent self-assessment validation process (Option 1).

## **INTERNAL AUDIT PLAN 2018/19 - IMPLEMENTATION PROGRESS REPORT – JANUARY – MARCH 2019**

**922.** The committee considered a report by the Chief Auditor regarding progress made on the implementation of the 2018/19 Internal Audit Plan from 1 January to 31 March 2019. It was confirmed that during the quarter fourteen audit reports relating to planned 2018/19 audit work had been issued, that the management response for one of the audit reports issued had yet to be received the due date for which had not yet passed and that, otherwise, all responses received had been satisfactory. Reference was also made to the quarterly performance indicators (PIs) for the section, a new request for assistance dealt with using contingency time, and a matter using contingency time brought to the committee's attention at the previous meeting which had been concluded and related findings.

The Chief Auditor explained why a report was being submitted to the committee regarding Quarter 4 which was linked to the detail now provided on audit findings in such reports, the outcome of the HSCP Self Directed Support Charges audit, and the impact of delayed feedback from departments on the section's PIs. In response to Councillor Ireland, she confirmed that an audit relating to the Leisure Trust had been delayed due to staff shortages but had been included in the 2019/20 Internal Audit Plan approved by the committee at its previous meeting.

The committee, following discussion, agreed:-

- (a) not to seek any of the reports issued in the quarter at this stage; and
- (b) otherwise, to note the report and related comments made.

## **INTERNAL AUDIT ANNUAL REPORT 2018/19**

**923.** The committee considered a report by the Chief Auditor regarding the annual report on the activities of internal audit during 2018/19, and providing an independent annual opinion on the adequacy and effectiveness of the Council's governance, risk management and internal controls based on work undertaken in 2018/19.

Whilst commenting on the successful implementation of the Plan, the Chief Auditor reported that all planned audits had been carried out, with the exception of one which had been deferred to 2019/20 on which she clarified the position, and that satisfactory responses had been received to all audits except one where the response date had not yet passed. Having commented on nine internal audit reports regarding which some recommendations had not been fully accepted and the related associated risks and reasons provided by management which had been accepted, she summarised the position on various potential fraud and contingency related issues. She also referred to issues that had impacted on PIs, clarified that the section operated in compliance with PSIAS, and confirmed that there was an excellent working relationship between her section and External Audit.

Regarding the annual statement on the adequacy and effectiveness of the Council's governance, risk management and internal controls, she confirmed that, based on the information available and work carried out, her opinion was that reasonable assurance could be placed upon the adequacy and effectiveness of these controls in the year to 31 March 2019. Reference was also made to internal audit performance indicators.

In response to Councillor Grant, the Chief Auditor confirmed that Police Scotland had been involved in 3 issues that had been explored using fraud contingency time which involved a

cost or loss to the Council. The Police had visited the premises involved and spoken to staff. However, she did not believe that the investigations had resulted in prosecution and considered the recovery of items unlikely.

Councillor Grant having referred to an issue referred to within the report on the use of the leavers checklist which had been commented on earlier in the meeting, the committee agreed:-

- (a) to approve the statement on the adequacy and effectiveness of the Council's governance, risk management and internal control systems and submit it to the Council; and
- (b) otherwise, to note the internal audit annual report 2018/19.

## **PROPOSED GUIDE TO SCRUTINY AND REVIEW**

**924.** The committee considered a report by the Chief Executive providing enhanced guidance on scrutiny, review and evaluation arrangements, within the overall context of Best Value, in East Renfrewshire Council. The report explained that an Audit of Best Value in East Renfrewshire Council had taken place in 2017, making reference to a recommendation made that Elected Members should take a more transparent and active role in scrutiny. Progress had already been made on a range of scrutiny issues, including the delivery of a new programme of essential scrutiny skills training and the appointment of a Scrutiny and Evaluation Officer to further support the work of the committee.

To complement this, a *Guide to Scrutiny and Review* had been prepared, in the context of Best Value, a copy of which was appended to the report. This was intended primarily for members of the committee to help them identify specific issues they wished to review and progress related work, such as by providing advice on good practice, selection and rejection criteria for reviews and questioning techniques. However, it would also be available to all Elected Members and committees of the Council. The *Guide* also referred to the development of a work plan for the committee, listed some potential policy and strategy areas for scrutiny based on policy areas within and outwith the Council, provided guidance on progressing detailed reviews, and confirmed the wider audit and scrutiny role of the committee.

Arising from related discussions, the committee also considered a further report, a copy of which was tabled, on issues discussed on a preliminary and informal basis with members thus far, interest expressed in looking at income generation and commercialisation as the committee's next piece of detailed work and related issues. Proposed objectives to be pursued were outlined, as was the type of related work that could be progressed and an indicative timetable for the review.

Having summarised the main purposes of the report, the Scrutiny and Evaluation Officer emphasised that the *Guide* was a good practice manual for the selection and undertaking of reviews. Amongst other things, he highlighted that it placed a strong focus on scrutiny whilst recognising other aspects of the committee's remit also; and covered why scrutiny was important and how it should be carried out and on an apolitical basis. Whilst referring to items within the work plan, he explained that the plan was intended to be a useful working document that would be updated periodically and which specified a range of planned cyclical reports, other work such as on national External Audit reports and progress reports on scrutiny and review investigations.

Having heard Councillor Miller refer to the discussions that had taken place thus far on these issues, supported by Councillor Ireland and on behalf of the committee, he expressed appreciation for the work done on the document which was considered useful.

Referring to informal meetings with members of the committee held recently, the Scrutiny and Evaluation Officer confirmed that, during discussion on potential review areas, particular interest had been expressed in income generation and commercialisation. Having referred to the Council's financial position, spending pressures and related issues, he commented on proposed objectives for the review, explaining that related work progressed could include interviews with officers and site visits within East Renfrewshire and to other local authorities as appropriate. A proposed timetable for the review was provided and it was confirmed that liaison would take place with members of the committee as work progressed, with much detailed work taking place between formal meetings.

Looking forward, the Scrutiny and Evaluation Officer explained that work on the potential scope of other potential reviews would be undertaken between now and the next meeting.

In response to Councillor Grant who commented that quite a lot of the review on income generation and commercialisation could focus on the environment department and more generally expressed interest in being involved in related meetings, the Scrutiny and Evaluation Officer confirmed that members of the committee would be invited to be involved in these. Mr Cornett reported that he had been involved in work on this issue with some English local authorities and that he would be happy to discuss related issues including lessons learned and what worked well or had not.

Whilst expressing support for the proposed review, Provost Fletcher commented on a music event to be held in Rouken Glen Park which had not been approved by Elected Members, commenting that Members and officers might not always share the same view on what might work well and that a one size fits all local authorities approach was not necessarily appropriate. The Clerk clarified that any recommendations arising from the review that the committee wished to make would require to be submitted to the Cabinet for consideration.

The committee agreed:-

- (a) to recommend to the Council that the draft *Guide to Scrutiny and Review* be approved, making it available to all committees and Members of the Council for their use;
- (b) to approve the 2019/20 annual work plan to the extent it had been developed thus far;
- (c) to note that a further update of the work plan would be submitted to the next meeting;
- (d) that a detailed review be progressed on income generation and commercialisation in relation to which the following objectives would be pursued:-
  - (i) gathering background information on current practices within other local authorities in Scotland and England, including lessons learned;
  - (ii) reviewing benchmarking information available, to identify service charges in other local authority areas not currently in place in East Renfrewshire;

- (iii) considering ethical, risk, reputation management and legal issues associated with selling advertising space;
  - (iv) exploring potential to pursue commercialisation opportunities in East Renfrewshire including identifying any potential restrictions and barriers; and
  - (v) reviewing audit reports available on the area of review;
- (e) that the indicative timetable for the review be approved as proposed; and
- (f) that work on the potential scope of other reviews suggested be undertaken between now and the next meeting.

### **COMMITTEE'S SPECIALISATION ARRANGEMENTS FOR DEALING WITH INTERNAL AND EXTERNAL AUDIT REPORTS AND INSPECTION REPORTS**

**925.** Under reference to the Minute of the meeting of 22 November 2018 (Page 631, Item 616 refers), when it had been agreed that the Clerk would circulate and seek the views of members of the committee on an analysis done on the number and type of internal and external audit reports, as well as inspection reports, each Member had dealt with since 2017 under the committee's current specialisations arrangements and any preferences they might have on their remits in future with a view to any proposed changes being formally submitted to a future meeting for consideration, the committee considered a report by the Clerk proposing changes to the committee's specialisation arrangements for dealing with such reports.

The report explained that the analysis undertaken had revealed that the workload was unbalanced. It specified the current specialisation arrangements in place, and the number of reports dealt with thus far by each Member and which it was anticipated they would deal with prior to the next local government elections if the arrangements remained unchanged.

In order to balance the workload more evenly, it was proposed that Councillors Swift and McLean would continue to lead on Corporate and Community Services issues but would also take on responsibility to lead on Education-related matters. It was also proposed that the Chair and Vice Chair would take on Councillor Ireland and Gilbert's remit for Environment Department issues.

The committee, having heard the Clerk in further explanation, agreed that the changes to the specialisation arrangements as proposed be approved and kept under review as required.

CHAIR